AFFAIRES GÉNÉRALES ET POLITIQUE
GENERAL AFFAIRS AND POLICY

Doc. prél. No 11 C
Prel. Doc. No 11 C

mars / March 2009

HccH
HAGUE CONFERENCE ON
PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW
CONFÉRENCE DE LA HAYE
DE DROIT INTERNATIONAL PRIVÉ

L'ACCÈS AU CONTENU DU DROIT ÉTRANGER

COMPILATION DES RÉPONSES AU QUESTIONNAIRE D'OCTOBRE 2008
POUR LA
RÉUNION D'EXPERTS SUR LA COOPÉRATION INTERNATIONALE RELATIVE À L'INFORMATION JURIDIQUE EN LIGNE SUR LE DROIT INTERNE

(La Haye, 19-21 octobre 2008)

établi par le Bureau Permanent

* * *

ACCESSING THE CONTENT OF FOREIGN LAW

COMPILATION OF RESPONSES TO THE QUESTIONNAIRE OF OCTOBER 2008
FOR THE
MEETING OF EXPERTS ON GLOBAL CO-OPERATION ON THE PROVISION OF ONLINE LEGAL INFORMATION ON NATIONAL LAWS

(The Hague, 19-21 October 2008)

drawn up by the Permanent Bureau

Document préliminaire No 11 C de mars 2009 à l'intention du Conseil de mars / avril 2009 sur les affaires générales et la politique de la Conférence

Preliminary Document No 11 C of March 2009 for the attention of the Council of March / April 2009 on General Affairs and Policy of the Conference

Permanent Bureau | *Bureau Permanent*
6, Scheveningseweg 2517 KT The Hague | *La Haye* The Netherlands | *Pays-Bas*
telephone | *téléphone* +31 (70) 363 3303 fax | *télécopieur* +31 (70) 360 4867
e-mail | *courriel* secretariat@hcch.net website | *site internet* http://www.hcch.net

L'ACCÈS AU CONTENU DU DROIT ÉTRANGER

COMPILATION DES RÉPONSES AU QUESTIONNAIRE D'OCTOBRE 2008

POUR LA

RÉUNION D'EXPERTS SUR LA COOPÉRATION INTERNATIONALE RELATIVE À L'INFORMATION JURIDIQUE EN LIGNE SUR LE DROIT INTERNE

(La Haye, 19-21 octobre 2008)

établi par le Bureau Permanent

* * *

ACCESSING THE CONTENT OF FOREIGN LAW

COMPILATION OF RESPONSES TO THE QUESTIONNAIRE OF OCTOBER 2008

FOR THE

MEETING OF EXPERTS ON GLOBAL CO-OPERATION ON THE PROVISION OF ONLINE LEGAL INFORMATION ON NATIONAL LAWS

(The Hague, 19-21 October 2008)

drawn up by the Permanent Bureau

TABLE DES MATIÈRES / TABLE OF CONTENTS

(1) What is the name and URL address of your organisation?
Quel est le nom et l'adresse URL de votre organisation ? 5

(2) How old is your organisation?
Depuis combien d'années votre organisation existe-t-elle ? 7

(3) What is the mission of your organisation?
Quelle est la mission de votre organisation ? 9

(4) What are the origins of your organisation (*e.g.*, private, at the request of the Bar, statutory source (government), etc.)?
Quelle est la genèse de votre organisation (par exemple: source privée, à la demande du Barreau, source statutaire (gouvernement), etc.) ? 12

(5) Are your services public, direct open access, or does one need to be a member?
Vos services sont-ils publics, en accès libre et direct, ou bien faut-il être abonné ? 14

(6) To which legal information does your database provide access (*e.g.*, statutes, regulations, case law, doctrine, etc)? Are these sources limited to certain areas of the law? If so, please specify these areas.
À quelles informations juridiques vos banques de données donnent-elles accès (par exemple: lois, règlements, jurisprudence, doctrine, etc.) ? Ces sources sont-elles limitées à certains domaines du droit ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez préciser ces domaines. 16

(7) What guarantee, if any, do you give for the accuracy of the legal information you provide? If a guarantee is given, how do you ensure the accuracy, reliability, authenticity and up-datedness of this information? Do you make use of a disclaimer of non-responsibility concerning the information you provide?
Quelle garantie, s'il y a lieu, donnez-vous quant à la qualité de l'information juridique que vous fournissez ? Si une garantie est donnée, comment assurez-vous l'exactitude, la fiabilité, l'authenticité et l'actualisation de cette information ? Faites-vous usage d'une clause de non-responsabilité au sujet de l'information que vous fournissez ? 19

(8) Is the legal information that you provide up-dated in real time?
L'information juridique que vous fournissez est-elle actualisée en temps réel ? 26

(9) Is the legal information that you provide up-dated automatically by electronic means (if so, please explain) or by human intervention, or by a combination of these two methods?
L'information juridique que vous fournissez est-elle actualisée automatiquement de façon électronique (dans l'affirmative, expliquez) ou par l'intervention d'une personne, ou une combinaison des ces deux méthodes ? 28

(10) What is (are) the original language(s) of this legal information?
Quelle(s) est (sont) cette (ces) langue(s) originale(s) de cette information juridique ? 30

(11) Is the legal information that you provide available in languages other than its original language? If so, please indicate into which language(s) it is translated.
L'information juridique que vous fournissez est-elle disponible en d'autres langues que dans la langue originale ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez indiquer la ou les langues vers la- ou lesquelles elle est traduite. 32

(12) What are the functionalities of your search engine (*e.g.*, open search, limited to predefined key words, etc.)?
Quelles sont les fonctionnalités de votre moteur (par exemple : recherche ouverte, limitée à des termes clefs prédéfinis, etc.) ? 34

(13) Is it possible to search in languages other than the original language of the available legal information?
Est-il possible de faire des recherches dans d'autres langues que la langue originale des informations juridiques qui sont disponibles ? 36

(14) Does your organisation provide services to persons (judges or others) seeking information about the application of foreign law in the context of litigation taking place abroad? If so, please describe these services.
Votre organisation donne-t-elle des services à des personnes (juges ou autres) qui veulent obtenir de l'information sur l'application du droit étranger dans le cadre de contentieux se tenant à l'étranger? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez décrire ces services. 38

(15) Do you gather statistics identifying the main users of your services (practitioners, judges, arbitrators, academics, etc.), their location (country, region or continent) and the context in which this information is sought (general interest, legal advice, litigation, policy, etc)? If so, could you please share this statistics?
Maintenez-vous des statistiques identifiant les principaux utilisateurs de vos services (praticiens, juges, arbitres, académiciens, etc.), leur origine (pays, région ou continent) et le contexte dans lequel cette information est recherchée (intérêt général, avis juridiques, contentieux, politiques et orientations, etc.) ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez communiquer ces statistiques. 40

(16) What is the added value of the services offered by your organisation?
Quelle est la valeur ajoutée des services offerts par votre organisation ? 50

(17) Are quality standards imposed on your services? If so, please indicate the source of such standards.
Des normes de qualité sont-elles imposées à vos services ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez indiquer leur source. 52

(18) If quality standards are not imposed on your services, did you adopt your own quality standards? If so, could you please indicate how these quality standards are established and verified.
Si des normes de qualité ne vous sont pas imposées, avez-vous adopté vos propres normes de qualité ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez indiquer comment ces dernières sont établies et évaluées. 54

(19) Approximately, what are the annual operation costs of your organisation in relation to online access to legal information? Please make a distinction between human resources and information technology associated costs.
Quels sont les frais approximatifs de fonctionnement annuels de votre organisation relatifs à l'accès en ligne à l'information juridique ? Veuillez distinguer entre vos coûts relatifs aux ressources humaines et ceux relatifs aux ressources informatiques. 56

(20) What are your sources of funding?
Quelles sont vos sources de financement ? 57

(21) Other relevant information for the purpose of your presentation, including your initial thoughts on the potential added value of any work to be undertaken by the Hague Conference.
Autres informations pertinentes pour les fins de la présentation, y compris vos pensées initiales relatives à la valeur ajoutée potentielle de tout travail à être entrepris par la Conférence de La Haye. 59

Answers from experts from organisations offering online access to legal information

—

Réponses des experts travaillant dans des organisations offrant un accès en ligne à l'information juridique

(1)	What is the name and URL address of your organisation? *Quel est le nom et l'adresse URL de votre organisation ?*

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
Name: Australasian Legal Information Institute (AustLII)
URL: http://www.austlii.edu.au/

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
Name: Canadian legal Information Institute / L'Institut canadien d'information juridique (CanLII)
URL: http://www.canlii.org

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
Name: Cornell Law Library, Ithaca, New York, USA
URL: http://library.lawschool.cornell.edu/.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
Name: Global Legal Information Network (GLIN)
URL: www.glin.gov.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Name: Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (ITTIG – CNR)
URL: http://www.ittig.cnr.it.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
Name: Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London
URL: http://ials.sas.ac.uk.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Nom : Institut suisse de droit comparé (ISDC) [Egalement: Schweizerisches Institut für Rechtsvergleichung; Istituto svizzero di diritto comparato; Swiss Institute of Comparative Law]
URL: www.isdc.ch

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Name: Jordanian Centre for Dispute Resolution (Aljazy & Co.) Advocates & Legal Consultants
URL: www.aljazylaw.com.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
Name: LexUM / Le laboratoire LexUM
URL: http://www.lexum. ca

LII (Thomas Bruce)
Name: The organization is named the "Legal Information Institute"
URL: http://www.law.cornell.edu.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)

Name: Max-Planck-Institut für ausländisches und internationales Privatrecht (Max Planck Institute for Foreign Private Law and Private International Law)

URL: http://www.mpipriv.de.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**

- *Nom : Office des publications officielles des Communautés européennes* / Office for Official Publications of the European Communities
  URL : http://publications.europa.eu/.
- *Nom : EUR-Lex, L'accès au droit de l'Union européenne* / EUR-Lex, Access to the law of the European Union
  URL : http://eur-lex.europa.eu.
- *Nom: N-Lex*
  URL: http://eur-lex.europa.eu/n-lex/.

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)

- Name: Bundeskanzleramt (Federal Chancellery Austria)
  URL: www.bka.gv.at.
- Name: RIS (Legal Information System)
  URL: www.ris.bka.gv.at.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)

The SADER Group of companies includes:

- Name: SADER Publishers
  URL :<www.saderpublishers.com>.
- Name: SADER Legal Publishing
  URL: <www.saderlegal.com>.
- Name: SADER & Associates Advocates & Legal Consultants
  URL: www.saderlaw.com
- SADER Law Research Centre (SLRC)
- and other related companies such as Kolpia LLC; GNS LLC

WorldLII / CommonLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)

- Name: World Legal Information Institute (WorldLII)
  URL: <http://www.worldlii.org>.
- Name: Commonwealth Legal Information Institute (CommonLII)
  URL: <http://commonlii.org>.
- Name: Asian Legal Information Institute
  URL:<http://www.asianlii.org>

(2) How old is your organisation?

Depuis combien d'années votre organisation existe-t-elle ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
Over 13 years - operational since 1995.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
CanLII was established in 2000 (it is 8 years old) / CanLII a été créé en 2000 (CanLII a 8 ans).

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
Law Library started in 1887, together with Cornell Law School.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN is an outgrowth of an in-house indexing project started at the U.S. Law Library of Congress in the 1950s to provide better access to the laws published in official gazettes to support the research and reference needs of the Law Library's attorneys. The concept of a network of legislatures exchanging information, the basis of GLIN, was formulated about 1991.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
The Institute of Legal Theory and Techniques of the Italian National Research Council (ITTIG-CNR) was established in 1968 (with the name of Institute for Legal Documentation) and it is located in Florence (Italy).

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
Founded in 1947.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Créé par une loi fédérale du 6 octobre 1978 (RS 425.1), l'Institut suisse de droit comparé (ISDC) a ouvert ses portes au public en 1982.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Aljazy & Co. was established in 2003.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
LexUM has operated free access services since 1993 (for 15 years) / LexUM offre l'accès gratuit au droit depuis 1993 (LexUM a 15 ans)

LII (Thomas Bruce)
We were the first legal-information site on the Web, operating since 1992.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
Founded in 1926.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
- *Office des publications créé par un acte du 16 janvier 1969.*
- *L'origine du système EUR-Lex se situe au début des années 1970. Le premier acte disponible relativement au système (alors Celex) est une résolution du Conseil des Communautés européennes, du 26 novembre 1974, concernant l'automatisation de la documentation juridique (resolution of the Council of the European Communities, of 26 November 1974, on the automation of legal documentation).*
- *N-Lex est ouvert au public comme système expérimental depuis le 26 avril 2006.*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
90 years.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
SADER: SADER was established in 1863 (in existence for 145 years).

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
- WorldLII (2001);
- CommonLII (2005);
- AsianLII (2006)

(3) What is the mission of your organisation?

Quelle est la mission de votre organisation ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
"AustLII's mission is to be a centre of excellence in the computerisation of legal information through research, operation of public access facilities, and teaching, thus advancing the public interest in free access to public legal information within Australia and internationally." [from Mission Statement, p. 7 AustLII 2007 Annual Report at <http://www.austlii.edu.au/austlii/reports/2007/AustLII_AR_2007.pdf>]. The Mission Statement also includes many other specific objectives.

AustLII's mission also includes furthering the aims of the Free Access to Law Movement, of which it is a founding member, as set out in the Declaration on Free Access to Law (2002, as amended) <http://www.worldlii.org/worldlii/declaration/>.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
CanLII: CanLII supports the legal profession in the performance of its duties while providing the Canadian public with permanent open access to the legal heritage of all Canadian jurisdictions./CanLII appuie la profession juridique dans l'exercice de ses fonctions tout en offrant au public canadien un accès libre et permanent au patrimoine juridique de toutes les juridictions canadiennes.

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
The mission of the Cornell Law Library is to advance legal research, scholarship, and education by providing outstanding and innovative information services and resources in the most efficient manner to the Law School, the University, and the transnational research community.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
The mission of GLIN is to promote the rule of law within and among nations by facilitating the orderly development of national and international laws. GLIN hopes to encourage mutual understanding among peoples with differing legal heritages. Through the GLIN Charter members have agreed to work cooperatively to develop a legal archive that will provide access to authentic versions of the law in their original language. The means to achieve this goal is the creation of a database that contains the full text of the laws from member jurisdictions. Each law is accompanied by a summary in English (the common language of GLIN). The data is organized under a standardized scheme and is indexed by a shared controlled vocabulary that is currently available in thirteen languages.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Research into and development of technologies in the field of information and communications technology applied to law and to public administration services.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
The role of the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies is to conduct research; to promote and facilitate, within London and nationally and internationally, research and scholarship at an advanced level across the whole field of law; to disseminate the results of such research and scholarship; and to provide to all those undertaking research in law a library facility with up to date technology, that is international in character and standing.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Aux termes de la loi sur l'ISDC (annexe) :

« 1. L'institut doit:
a. Mettre à disposition des autorités et de l'administration fédérales les documents et les études nécessaires pour les lois et les conventions internationales;
b. Participer aux efforts internationaux de rapprochement ou d'unification du droit;
c. Donner des renseignements et des avis de droit aux tribunaux, aux organes administratifs, aux avocats et à d'autres intéressés;
d. Mener ses propres recherches scientifiques, promouvoir et coordonner des études dans les hautes écoles suisses et offrir aux chercheurs en suisse un centre de recherches approprié.
2. L'institut tient une bibliothèque spécialisée et une documentation en matière de législations étrangères et de droit international »

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Assisting local, regional and international clients in achieving their professional objectives in different legal environments.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
LexUM offers legal informatics solutions and services and runs research projects to favor the best uses of technology for law. / LexUM offre des services et des solutions en informatique juridique et mène des travaux de recherche afin de favoriser les meilleures applications des technologies en droit.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
Our mission is fivefold. First, we conduct applied research in legal publishing techniques using information technology. Second, we experiment with novel forms of content – particularly commentary and secondary sources – that are enabled or enhanced by emerging technologies, with the aim of increasing public understanding of law. Third, we look at the effects of legal-information availability on public policy, on economic development, and on the legal profession. Fourth, we work on standards and infrastructure development aimed at joining distributed, administratively independent legal information resources into federated systems. Finally, we promote interdisciplinary conversations and research projects involving legal experts, computer scientists, information architects, librarians, and social scientists.

Unlike many of the namesake organizations that have followed us, we have never aimed to be a comprehensive, free-to-air national repository of primary legal materials.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
Research in the field of foreign private law and private international law.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
- *L'Office des publications officielles des Communautés européennes (Office des publications) est la maison d'édition de l'Union européenne (UE).*
- *Il publie quotidiennement le Journal officiel de l'Union européenne dans plus de 21 langues, phénomène unique dans le monde de l'édition. Il publie également divers autres titres, sur papier ou sous forme électronique, relatifs aux activités et aux politiques de l'Union européenne.*
- *L'Office des publications propose en outre plusieurs services en ligne qui permettent d'accéder gratuitement à des informations sur le droit communautaire (EUR-Lex), les publications de l'Union (EU Bookshop), les marchés publics (TED) et les activités de recherche et développement (CORDIS).*

—

- The Office for Official Publications of the European Communities (Publications Office) is the publishing house of the European Union (EU).

- Its Official Journal of the European Union is published daily in more than 21 languages, a unique phenomenon in the publishing world. The Publications Office also publishes a range of other titles on paper as well as electronically, on the activities and policies of the European Union.
- Furthermore, the Publications Office offers a number of online services giving free access to information on EU law (EUR-Lex), EU publications (EU Bookshop), EU public procurement (TED), and EU research and development (CORDIS).

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
Coordination of the Federal Government activities; constitutional issues.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
- Facilitating people's access to Arab legal information around the world.
- Building a new legal culture in the Arab Region.
- Being the leading Arab legal information provider in the world.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
See AustLII answers; specific objectives also include "Cooperate with other providers of public legal information, in Australia and internationally, to maximise the public benefit obtained by use of scarce public resources."

In relation to WorldLII, AustLII aims to achieve a number of aims: (i) to provide a portal to allow a single point of access to the databases of all members of the Free Access to Law Movement who wish to collaborate in relation to WorldLII; (ii) to provide a wide range of databases on international law, including treaties and the decisions of international Courts and Tribunals; and (iii) to provide other databases of national laws from countries not yet included in the Free Access to Law Movement, where projects undertaken by AustLII make that desirable.

In relation to CommonLII, AustLII aims to provide databases of key legal information from all Commonwealth and common law countries, primarily as a portal provided in conjunction with other members of the Free Access to Law Movement, but also as a means of encouraging and assisting the development of independent free access to law providers in other Commowealth countries.

In relation to AsianLII, AustLII aims to provide databases of key legal information from all 28 countries in Asia, as a portal to the content of other members of the Free Access to Law Movement wherever that is possible. Where no local LII exists at present, a main purpose of AsianLII is to assist the development of such local facilities over time, while hosting local databases in the interim.

(4) What are the origins of your organisation (*e.g.*, private, at the request of the Bar, statutory source (government), etc.)?

Quelle est la genèse de votre organisation (par exemple: source privée, à la demande du Barreau, source statutaire (gouvernement), etc.) ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
AustLII is a joint facility of the Faculties of Law at University of Technology, Sydney (UTS) and the University of New South Wales (UNSW). It was established under an Australian Research Council (ARC) research infrastructure grant with the support of the Council of Australian Law Deans (CALD).

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
CanLII was created by LexUM and the Federation of Law Societies of Canada in 2000. The partners are still working together developing CanLII today. / CanLII a été mis sur pied par LexUM et la Fédération des ordres professionnels de juristes du Canada en 2000. Ces organismes sont toujours partenaires dans le développement de CanLII.

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
Law Library was founded to support the research and teaching programs of the Law School.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN was initiated at the U.S. Law Library of Congress in 1991. Conceptually GLIN is based upon the Brussels Convention of 1886 on the Exchange of Official Gazettes and Parliamentary Papers. GLIN is designed to facilitate the exchange of documents between governments by taking advantage of information technology to allow an electronic exchange in addition to or, eventually, in lieu of the exchange of paper documents.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Statutory source (government).

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
The Institute was set up as by government as a national academic resource.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
L'Institut suisse de droit comparé a été créé par la volonté commune des Universités suisses et d'un donateur privé, porté par la Confédération suisse, avec le soutien du canton de Vaud.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
The origin of the Aljazy & Co. law firm is the private sector.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
LexUM was established in 1993 by Professor Daniel Poulin at the Faculty of Law of the University of Montreal. LexUM became an independent laboratory attached to the Faculty in 2004. / LexUM a été mis sur pied par le professeur Daniel Poulin à partir de 1993 à la Faculté de droit de l'Université de Montréal. LexUM est devenu une structure de recherche et de service indépendante au sein de la Faculté de droit en 2004.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
We are a research project of the Cornell University Law School.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
One of the 80 institutes of the Max Planck Society which roughly corresponds to an Academy of Sciences.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**

- *+ à l'origine* (no official English translation) *Décision du Parlement européen, du Conseil, de la Commission, de la Cour de justice et du Comité économique et social, du 16 janvier 1969 portant installation de l'Office des publications officielles des Communautés européennes (80/443/CEE, Euratom, CECA)*
- *+ actuellement en vigueur (mais procédure de révision en cours) Décision du Parlement européen, du Conseil, de la Commission, de la Cour de justice, de la Cour des comptes, du Comité économique et social et du Comité des régions du 20 juillet 2000 relative à l'organisation et au fonctionnement de l'Office des publications officielles des Communautés européennes (2000/459/CE, CECA, Euratom)*

—

- Decision of the European Parliament, the Council, the Commission, the Court of Justice, the Court of Auditors, the Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions of 20 July 2000 on the organisation and operation of the Office for Official Publications of the European Communities (2000/459/EC, ECSC, Euratom)

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
Government.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
SADER: Privately owned company. SADER has engaged in joint efforts with a large number of public and private entities such as Amideast, US AID, UNDP, Lebanese Ministry of Justice, UAE Ministry of Justice, Kuwait Ministry of Justice, Beirut Bar Association, Jordanian Ministry of Justice, Dubai Public Prosecution, Abu Dhabi Courts and many specialized NGOs such as ADIL, Lebanese Intellectual Property Association (www.lipa-lb.org) and others.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
All have been developed at the initiative of AustLII, but have subsequently received various endorsements:

(i) WorldLII has from 2002 been recognised as the joint portal of members of the Free Access to Law Movement;

(ii) CommonLII was endorsed in 2005 by the Commonwealth Law Ministers Meeting in Ghana, and has also been endorsed by other leading Commonwealth institutions such as the Commonwealth Secretariat (see <http://www.commonlii.org/commonlii/sponsors/#commonwealth_supporting_institutions>);

(iii) AsianLII has been endorsed by a wide range of regional organisations in Asia <http://www.asianlii.org/asianlii/sponsors/#rsi> and is based on collaborations with 'country supporting institutions' in wide and growing range of Asian countries.

(5) Are your services public, direct open access, or does one need to be a member?

Vos services sont-ils publics, en accès libre et direct, ou bien faut-il être abonné ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
Free, public and anonymous access to all legal materials; there is no membership and no login requirements.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
CanLII provides free and open access to Canadian law to all. / CanLII offre un accès libre et gratuit au droit canadien pour tous.

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
Even though Cornell Law School is a private institution, the Law Library is open to the public, and has an extensive web site.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
The majority of information is freely accessible to the public through the GLIN website. Some jurisdictions, whose laws are not in the public domain, restrict access to their legal texts to GLIN members only. It is the policy of GLIN however, to promote open access to the legal instruments contributed by the members.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Some services are public, others are reserved to subscribers.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
Services are available to all legal researchers. Academic staff and postgraduate research students from any university worldwide are admitted without charge, other researchers are admitted on proof of need, normally on payment of a fee. Undergraduate students are not normally admitted. There is a process of registration before entry.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
L'accès à notre bibliothèque est ouvert à tous et gratuit, sans aucune formalité.

Pour la rédaction d'avis de droit ou les recherches bibliographiques notamment, l'Institut suisse de droit comparé perçoit des émoluments calculés selon le temps de travail et l'intérêt que le mandant porte à ces services. Ces émoluments sont fixés par Ordonnance (V. annexe).

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Part of our services are public and others require membership.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
LexUM offers the content it publishes, such as the Supreme Court of Canada decisions, to everyone and for free. LexUM's professional and technical services are sold to public and private legal organisations in Canada and abroad. / LexUM offre les contenus qu'il publie, comme le site de diffusion des décisions de la Cour suprême du Canada, en accès libre à tous. Les services de consultation et de développement de LexUM sont vendus aux organisations privées ou publiques canadiennes ou étrangères.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
Our services are open to all without fee. We require registration for some services as a way of compiling a contact database for fundraising purposes, but no payment is ever required.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)

Services are public provided an applicant can prove a scientific interest which cannot be met by other institutions. Upon admission, direct access is granted. Membership is not required.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**

- *Journal officiel (Official Journal), version papier (seule version authentique) : sur abonnement ou achat au numéro*
  Supplément au Journal officiel (avis de marchés publics) – sous forme électronique uniquement : souscription
  Recueil de jurisprudence (Cas-law Reports), papier : sur abonnement ou achat au fascicule
- *EUR-Lex : Diffusion électronique du Journal officiel de l'Union européenne, des traités, de la législation, de la jurisprudence, des questions parlementaires, des actes préparatoires etc., dans 22/23 langues officielles de l'Union européenne : accès libre et direct.*
- *N-Lex : système expérimental donnant accès à des bases législatives nationales des États membres ; accès libre et direct. Développé à la demande des États membres.*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)

The Legal Information System is public and is free of charge.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)

SADER services include public, open access and memberships.

- Services with open public access include but are not limited to: the Lebanese State Council website (created and updated by SADER) which includes a large number of state council case decisions: www.statecouncil.gov.lb; the Lebanese laws in English website: www.lebaneselaws.com; the Lebanese Intellectual Property Website including information, news and studies related to IP in Lebanon and the Arab countries in both Arabic and English: www.lipa-lb.org; SADER & Associates website providing news and studies in English and Arabic: www.saderlaw.com. SADER is currently working on the Lebanese MOJ Department of Legislation and consultations website which will include part of the consultations of the said department. SADER assisted AIMS (Kuwait) in developing the GCC Legal portal in 2007 for the Kuwaiti Ministry of Justice. Other open access projects are also in SADER's plans for the coming several years. It is worth noting that SADER assisted many public entities in translating their websites from Arabic into English such as the Dubai Courts, the Jordanian Business Laws (please refer to Al Jazy/JCDR information) and the Dubai Public Prosecution (DPP).
- Limited Open access: include the legal information database provided from SADER to the DPP where an open access was given to all the public prosecutors in Dubai and DPP employees. SADER is also developing for one of the leading law firms in Kuwait and the region an online database for the said law firm which will include the law firm's consultations and forms of agreements. Such online database will be used by the law firm lawyers and personnel.
- Paid services: Due to the fact that Arab societies were not very familiar with e-commerce (including e-payments) activities, SADER will not move to online paid services until 2008 when it will launch its pan-Arab legal website and the website of the Ministry of Justice in the UAE (which will provide all the UAE Federal legislation in Arabic, the UAE Federal laws in English, the UAE Federal Supreme Court case studies from 1972, the MOJ consultations from 1972 and international treaties). Other "online paid services" projects are also being developed. It is also worth mentioning that SADER has many CD-based electronic products circulating in the Region.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)

All three provide free, public and anonymous access to all legal materials; there is no membership and no login requirements.

(6) To which legal information does your database provide access (*e.g.*, statutes, regulations, case law, doctrine, etc)? Are these sources limited to certain areas of the law? If so, please specify these areas.

À quelles informations juridiques vos banques de données donnent-elles accès (par exemple: lois, règlements, jurisprudence, doctrine, etc.) ? Ces sources sont-elles limitées à certains domaines du droit ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez préciser ces domaines.

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
AustLII has over 270 databases of legal materials from all major Australian jurisdictions (federal, states and territories). The databases include, for all jurisdictions, all legislation and related materials (regulations, bills and explanatory statements), case law from almost all courts in Australia and most significant tribunals (over 140 Courts and Tribunals), over 50 law journals, law reform reports from all Australian law reform bodies, and treaties (the Australian Treaties Library contains every treaty to which Australia is a party since Federation in 1900).

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
CanLII provides access to the statutes and regulations of all Canadian jurisdictions, and to case law from all Canadian courts and of over a hundred boards and tribunals. A significant number of these databases are bilingual. / CanLII propose un acces à la legislation de toutes les juridictions internes canadiennes ainsi qu'à la jurisprudence de toutes les cours et à celle de plus d'une centaine de tribunaux administratifs. Les collections sont en partie bilingues.

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
The Law Library currently provides access to information from a variety of sources, and organizes that information. It has a very large print collection, and access to thousands of electronic sources. It also has unique sources which are in part digitized and the object of requests by lawyers and the public, such as a vast collection of Liberia laws (a former professor helped write the laws, and many have been destroyed, Cornell may be the only holder of some).

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN includes four "modules" of legal information: laws (constitutions, statutes, regulations, codes and similar statutory instruments); judicial decisions; legislative records (*e.g.*, parliamentary debates, hearings, committee reports); and legal literature (doctrine, commentaries). At present, the system includes only national-level legislation (not sub-national information for federal jurisdictions) and judicial decisions from the highest court(s) in a given jurisdiction. Subject coverage is comprehensive reflecting the broad interests of the members' legislatures.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
DOGI Database (Legal Doctrine), DOGIS (Foreign Doctrine on the fields of human rights, European law, Information and communication technologies and law).

ITTIG is part of the National research Council (CNR) which provides free access to regulations.

Moreover ITTIG-CNR is partner of the NIR Project (Legislation on the Internet) which aims at providing free access to legislative documents published on different Public Administration Offices' websites.

ITTIG is part of the NIR national working group which established the URN and XML open standards for Italian legislation, as well as of the European working group (CEN Metalex) developing standards for legislation at the European level.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)

- Catalog (OPAC) of the Institute's holdings (300,000+ volumes)
- Link to the commercial legal databases subscribed individually by the Institute, or subscribed by the University of London
- Link to the electronic journals subscribed by the Institute plus a link to electronic journals freely available on the Internet
- Electronic Law Library as an alternative route to access various free and subscription databases
- Listing of print and electronic journal titles with online links to subscription and free electronic journals
- Host the British and Irish Legal Information Institute (BAILII) http://www.bailii.org which publishes full text primary legal material from all jurisdictions of Britain and Ireland free of charge on the Internet. Material is taken from official sources, including direct from judges
- Compile in-house and national databases including INTUTE LAW, see http://ials.sas.ac.uk/library/intute/intutelaw.htm which is a national gateway to legal websites including selection, assessment and descriptions.
- The Intute Disclaimer is appended below [answer to question 7]. Also Current Legal Research Topics database, http://ials.sas.ac.uk/library/clrt/clrt.htm and various other finding and evaluation tools and guides to materials

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**

La bibliothèque est abonnée à 39 banques de données juridiques (en ligne ou sous forme de CD-ROM ou de DVD) présentant la législation, jurisprudence et doctrine de nombreux pays, ainsi que les travaux d'organisations internationales. Tous les domaines du droit privé et public sont couverts par ces banques de données.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)

Aljazy & Co. law firm collaborates jointly on different online legal information projects (kindly refer to Sader information attached).

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)

Supreme Court decisions, from 1967 to present (English and French). Various Conference Proceedings. / Les décisions de la Cour suprême du Canada de 1967 à aujourd'hui. Les Actes de diverses conférences en informatique juridique (en français et en anglais)

LII (Thomas Bruce)

As implied in the answer to question 3, we offer no comprehensive collections of any kind, preferring to concentrate on high-value "flagship" collections that demonstrate new ideas and techniques. We offer (among many other things) the full United States Code, the decisions of the US Supreme Court, and a wiki-based legal encyclopedia and dictionary. In addition, we offer important notification and current-awareness services via e-mail and RSS feed. The total page count for the site is around 350,000, of which about 10% contain original commentary and other editorially-constructed resources.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)

- Catalog (OPAC) of the Institute's holdings (480.000 volumes)
- Catalog enrichment (tables of contents are added to the OPAC in a PDF format
- Link to the databases subscribed individually by the Institute, or subscribed by the Max Planck Society for two or more Institutes
- Link to the electronic journals subscribed by the Institute plus a link to electronic journals freely available on the Internet
- No Max-Planck-Institute portal, but a linked collection is offered on our home page.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot) –**

- *EUR-Lex*
  - *-Journal officiel en format PDF depuis 1998*
  - *Législation depuis 1952 (origine)*
  - *Collection complète des traités*
  - *législation consolidée dans 21 langues (maltais incomplet ; pas de consol. en irlandais)*
  - *jurisprudence depuis 1954 (origine) – dans les notices de chaque affaire, référence de la doctrine commentant cette jurisprudence*
  - *actes préparatoires depuis 1999 (rattrapage depuis 1958 en cours)*
  - *questions parlementaires (rattrapage en cours)*
  - *pour la législation qui doit être transposée par les États membres, référence de la législation nationale*
- *N-Lex : Bases législatives uniquement, choisies par les États membres*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)

It's an information platform on the current law in the Republic of Austria. It serves as the authentic publication of the Federal Law Gazettes since 1st January 2004.

Additionally, information on Austrian law, Federal Law, State Law, State Law Gazettes and Jurisdiction is provided.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)

SADER online projects include law compendiums, case decisions, consultations, studies, doctrine and legal news.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)

All following answers relate only to the databases maintained by AustLII on these services, not those maintained by other LIIs.

WorldLII allows approximately 900 databases to be searched simultaneously, of which over half (450) are maintained by AustLII, either on the AustLII service (270), on AsianLII (approx 150), in WorldLII's International Courts and Tribunals Library (20), and on CommonLII (20).

The databases maintained by AustLII (other than those on AustLII's Australian service) include about 300,000 cases in full text, and over 20,000 pieces of legislation. A more detailed analysis can be provided on request.

(7) What guarantee, if any, do you give for the accuracy of the legal information you provide? If a guarantee is given, how do you ensure the accuracy, reliability, authenticity and up-datedness of this information? Do you make use of a disclaimer of non-responsibility concerning the information you provide?

Quelle garantie, s'il y a lieu, donnez-vous quant à la qualité de l'information juridique que vous fournissez ? Si une garantie est donnée, comment assurez-vous l'exactitude, la fiabilité, l'authenticité et l'actualisation de cette information ? Faites-vous usage d'une clause de non-responsabilité au sujet de l'information que vous fournissez ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)

AustLII does not guarantee the accuracy of legal information provided via its website. A disclaimer is stated at <http://www.austlii.edu.au/austlii/disclaimers.html> (reproduced below).

> **Disclaimers of liability**
>
> AustLII is a free service.
>
> AustLII does not invite reliance upon, nor accept responsibility for, the information it provides. AustLII makes every effort to provide a high quality service. However, neither AustLII, its host Universities, nor the providers of data on AustLII, give any guarantees, undertakings or warranties concerning the accuracy, completeness or up-to-date nature of the information provided. Users should confirm information from another source if it is of sufficient importance for them to do so.
>
> Hypertext links on AustLII are (in most cases) inserted by AustLII, not by the data providers. Automated insertion of over 40 million hypertext links on AustLII (as at May 2008) means that links will not be comprehensive or accurate in all cases. Neither AustLII, its host Universities, nor its providers of data, give any guarantees, undertakings or warranties concerning hypertext linking.
>
> AustLII is jointly operated by the University of New South Wales and the University of Technology, Sydney (the 'host Universities').

The reliability of information provided by AustLII comes from the relationships it has built up with its sources of information (Courts, Tribunals, legislation offices etc) for over a decade, and from recognition by users that those official sources of data continue to provide data to AustLII. More than half of the Courts and Tribunals providing data to AustLII do not make their decisions available for free public access by any other means, indicating that they are satisfied with the quality of the service provided by AustLII.

Data is obtained directly from the official source. Courts and tribunals send decisions directly to AustLII's automated email feed system (or in one case via an intermediary State government system). Legislation is obtained from the Parliamentary Counsel's Offices (and relevant Drafting Offices) as appropriate, by a variety of technical methods. Treaties are sent from the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT).

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)

Accuracy and reliability are based on well-defined processes applied by trained regular staff supported by sophisticated software. For CanLII, LexUM designed a two step publishing process, where the second step relates to quality control. Quality control is served by various computer programs and human inspection of documents. Documents published are not however read from top to bottom. For the major databases, such as appellate court decisions, database comprehensiveness is controlled by comparing content to 35 published reports series. Missing documents are scanned and added.

Updating: Legislative databases used to be updated monthly. However, the procedure is now being changed. As of today five jurisdictions are updated weekly, and by September 2009, all statutes and regulations will be updated weekly. With regard to case law, updates are made daily. In both cases, legislation and case law, the publishing process will entail a two-day delay before the content is on the web site.
Authenticity: CanLII only publishes content from original sources. All quality checking processes are designed to protect the document's integrity end-to-end.

L'exactitude et la fiabilité : Le traitement de l'information est défini dans des procédures qui sont appliquées par des employés réguliers formés pour leur travail. Finalement, de nombreux programmes soutiennent leurs activités de publication. La publication des documents s'organise enfin en deux étapes, dont la seconde a trait au contrôle de qualité. Le contrôle de qualité s'appuie sur de nombreux programmes d'appui et l'inspection visuelle des documents. Les documents publiés ne sont toutefois pas lus de façon systématique. Notons enfin que dans le cas des collections principales, celles des cours d'appel, l'exhaustivité est contrôlée par la comparaison systématique de nos collections avec le matériel publié dans 35 recueils imprimés. Les documents qui seraient identifiés comme manquants sont ajoutés lorsque leur absence est constatée. La jurisprudence est publiée sur une base quotidienne, le processus de publication requiert deux jours.
L'actualisation : L'information législative est présentement mise à jour mensuellement. Toutefois, les mises à jour sont hebdomadaires pour 5 provinces et elles deviendront systématiquement hebdomadaires pour l'ensemble des provinces et le fédéral en en septembre 2009. Dans le cas de la jurisprudence, l'information est mise à jour quotidiennement. Dans l'un et l'autre cas, il peut s'écouler deux jours avant qu'un document reçu ne soit disponible.
L'authenticité : CanLII ne reçoit le matériel à être publié que des organes sources eux-mêmes et les processus mise en place pour la publication sont conçus pour protéger l'intégrité des documents de bout en bout.

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
In general, from my perspective, there is a distinction between online sites providing access to legal information, and sites providing the official and authentic version of legal documents. The standard of trustworthiness varies, depending on the use, for instance, if the information is a starting point, or if it to be used as the authentic version, according to the standards of evidence expected in a court of law or by a government entity. A French example is the authenticated version of the *Journal Officiel* on the official website, and the non authenticated one on Legifrance, the mission of which is access to law for the public.

As governments discontinue print documents to save costs and rely entirely on the digital version, the need for authentication of official digital law becomes ever more important, so that citizens can trust "the official word of the law." See below under question 21.

As an analogy, U.S. courts are requiring rigorous electronic record authentication, before e-records can be admitted as evidence in the court.[1]

Also, many countries and international organizations have come up with legislation on electronic signatures to facilitate electronic commerce. [2]

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN works with government agencies or their designees—those who enact or publish the laws of their jurisdiction. These individuals are in the best position to attest to the authenticity of the information that they contribute to GLIN. In early

[1] http://www.metrocorpcounsel.com/current.php?artType=view&artMonth=September&artYear=2007&EntryNo=7166.
[2] An Analysis of International Electronic and Digital Signature Implementation Initiatives. A Study Prepared for the Internet Law & Policy Forum (ILPF) September, 2000. http://www.ilpf.org/groups/analysis_IEDSII.htm.

November 2008, a new release of GLIN will be introduced that will include digital certificates to ensure users of the integrity and authenticity of the data. Since the information is contributed by jurisdictions over which GLIN exercises no direct control, the currency of the information cannot be guaranteed. No claim is made (and no disclaimer is yet offered) to indicate that the information may not be up to date

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Information provided in the DoGi and DoGis databases are provided by an editorial staff of legal experts and archivists (who provide abstracts, classification, bibliographic references of the articles). All the information is covered by copyright.

Moreover ITTIG-CNR contributes to the quality of the documents provided within the NIR project, since it is involved in the definition of URN and XML standards for legislation.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
The BAILII service is the only full text service of primary legal information, the other services are guides and finding tools. The BAILII disclaimer is appended below. There are also Privacy and Copyright policies. The INTUTE disclaimer is appended below. No guarantee is given. Accuracy is determined by use of original / authentic sources and employing professional librarians / information staff / lawyers and by oversight of Board of Trustees comprising senior lawyers.

> **BAILII Disclaimer:**
>
> "BAILII is a free service.
>
> BAILII does not invite reliance upon, nor accept responsibility for, the information it provides. BAILII makes every effort to provide a high quality service. However, neither BAILII, its host Universities, nor the providers of data on BAILII, give any guarantees, undertakings or warranties concerning the accuracy, completeness or up-to-date nature of the information provided. Users should confirm information from another source if it is of sufficient importance for them to do so. For example:
> (a) The judgments of any court below the highest level may have been the subject of an appeal, and there are likely to be instances where the judgment on appeal has not been made available to BAILII. Users should satisfy themselves that a judgment has not been the subject of an appeal before relying on it as an authority.
> (b) Legislation published on this web site may not yet be in force, or may have been amended or repealed. Users are warned that the publication of legislation on this web site does not indicate that any particular provision in a statute or statutory instrument was, or is currently, in force.
> (c) Hypertext links on BAILII are (in most cases) inserted by BAILII, not by the data providers. Automated insertion of over 10 million hypertext links on BAILII means that links will not be comprehensive or accurate in all cases. Neither BAILII, its host Universities, nor its providers of data, give any guarantees, undertakings or warranties concerning hypertext linking.
> (d) Many judgments are provided to BAILII in word-processing format (usually .rtf), and are then automatically converted into HTML format by a customised conversion program which aims, so far as possible, to reproduce the formatting of the original judgments. In view of the number of new judgments provided, it is not possible to proof-read the converted HTML version of every judgment. The judgments are produced using many different types of document formatting, and are not always provided in a consistent form. This occasionally leads to inconsistencies in the HTML conversion. The HTML version is provided as it provides greater functionality in relation to on-line searching, and it is displayed more quickly by browsers.
> (e) Judgments published on BAILII may not be the authentic version of the judgment.

(i) The HTML version is not the authentic version of the judgment. For many judgments of the English courts the Approved Judgment in .rtf format is also available to be downloaded from BAILII.

(ii) In a number of instances, the judgment published on BAILII is derived from the shorthand-writer's transcript as opposed to the version to be found in published law reports. In these instances there are likely to be discrepancies (usually of a minor nature) between the version published on BAILII and the law reports version. BAILII is unable to publish the law reports version as a result of copyright restrictions.

(f) Where cases are to be cited in court, practitioners should comply with the Practice Notes on Citation of Authorities (Court of Appeal (Civil Division) [1995] 1 WLR 1096; [1995] 3 All ER 256 and [1996] 1 WLR 854; [1996] 3 All ER 382, the requirements of which are reproduced in section 8 of the Practice Statement on Judgments (22nd April 1998). This provides as follows:

When authority is cited, whether in written or oral submissions, the following practice should in general be followed.

- If a case is reported in the official Law Reports published by the Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for England and Wales, that report should be cited. These are the most authoritative reports; they contain a summary of argument; and they are the most readily available.
- If a case is not (or not yet) reported in the official Law Reports, but is reported in the Weekly Law Reports or the All England Law Reports, that report should be cited.
- If a case is not reported in any of these series of reports, a report in any of the authoritative specialist series of reports may be cited. Such reports may not be readily available: photostat copies of the leading authorities or the relevant parts of such authorities should be annexed to written submissions; and it is helpful if Photostat copies of the less frequently used series are made available in court.

It is recognised that occasions arise when one report is fuller than another, or when there are discrepancies between reports. On such occasions, the practice outlined above need not be followed. It is always helpful if alternative references are given. Where a reserved written judgment has not been reported, reference should be made to the official transcript (if this is available) and not to the handed down text of the judgment.

Leave to cite unreported cases will not usually be granted unless counsel are able to assure the court that the transcript in question contains a relevant statement of legal principle not found in reported authority and that the authority is not cited because of the phraseology used or as an illustration of the application of an established legal principle."

INTUTE Disclaimer:
Disclaimer

Resources listed by Intute are selected by specialists and regularly checked for accuracy and currency. We hope you find them useful. However we are not responsible for the content of external websites, or any consequences arising from actions carried out as a result of using information from those resources.

In no event shall Intute, The University of Manchester and the University of Bristol be liable for any damages whatsoever, and in particular Intute shall not be liable for special, indirect, consequential, or incidental damages, or damages for lost profits, loss of revenue, or loss of use, arising out of or related to the Intute website or the information contained in it, whether such damages arise in contract, negligence, tort, under statute, in equity, at law or otherwise.

The information provided in the Intute: Health and Life Sciences section should not be used for diagnosis or treatment of any medical condition. We cannot give actual medical or health advice on the practices or products that exist within the life sciences sector.

To help us maintain our high quality, please alert Intute immediately if you suspect the information contained within a resource is inaccurate or significantly out of date.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
A ce jour l'Institut ne fournit pas d'information juridique propre en ligne. L'information juridique accessible via les diverses bases de données est sous la responsabilité des fournisseurs des dites bases de données.

L'Institut publie sur son site web (www.isdc.ch) un certain nombre de publications (E-SDC, ISDC's Letter, EU News : Click & Read) qui sont à jour à la date de leur mise en ligne.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
The source of the statute published is the Official Gazette; no guarantee is given to the user.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
Documents are from the Court, and they are processed automatically by specialized programs. / Les documents proviennent de la Cour, sont traités automatiquement par des programmes spécifiques.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
We give no guarantees, but work from official sources distributed directly by the issuing bodies. In some collections we use disclaimers. Obviously, this answer is closely tied to the questions about quality below – see there for further discussion.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
The institute provides legal opinions if a question is of scientific interest. In this case a disclaimer is made use of.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
- *aucune garantie : Avis juridique important sur EUR-Lex (Important legal notice)*

CLAUSE DE NON-RESPONSABILITE

Le présent site de l'Office des publications vise à promouvoir l'accès du public aux informations relatives à ses initiatives et aux politiques de l'Union européenne en général. Notre objectif est de diffuser des informations exactes et à jour. Nous nous efforcerons de corriger les erreurs qui nous seront signalées. Toutefois, l'Office des publications n'assume aucune responsabilité quant aux informations que contient le présent site.

Ces informations:
- *sont exclusivement de nature générale et ne visent pas la situation particulière d'une personne physique ou morale;*
- *ne sont pas nécessairement complètes, exhaustives, exactes ou à jour;*
- *renvoient parfois à des sites extérieurs sur lesquels les services de l'Office des publications n'ont aucun contrôle et pour lesquels l'Office des publications décline toute responsabilité;*
- *ne constituent pas un avis professionnel ou juridique (si vous avez besoin d'avis spécifiques, consultez toujours un professionnel dûment qualifié).*

Notez aussi qu'il n'est pas possible de garantir qu'un document disponible en ligne reproduise exactement un texte adopté officiellement. Seul fait foi le texte de la législation de l'Union européenne publié dans les éditions papier du Journal officiel de l'Union européenne.

Nous souhaitons limiter autant que possible les inconvénients occasionnés par des erreurs techniques. Cependant, certaines données ou informations présentes sur notre site peuvent ne pas avoir été créées ou structurées dans des fichiers ou des formats exempts d'erreurs, de sorte que nous ne pouvons garantir que notre service ne sera pas interrompu ou autrement affecté par de tels

problèmes. L'Office des publications décline toute responsabilité quant aux problèmes de ce type pouvant résulter d'une utilisation de ce site ou de tout autre site extérieur auquel il renvoie.

La présente clause de non-responsabilité n'a pas pour but de limiter la responsabilité de l'Office des publications de manière contraire aux exigences posées dans les législations nationales applicables ou d'exclure sa responsabilité dans les cas où elle ne peut l'être en vertu desdites législations.

—

DISCLAIMER

The Publications Office maintains this website to enhance public access to European Union law. Our goal is to keep this information timely and accurate. If errors are brought to our attention, we will try to correct them. However the Publications Office accepts no responsibility or liability whatsoever with regard to the information on this site.

This information is:

- of a general nature only and is not intended to address the specific circumstances of any particular individual or entity;
- not necessarily comprehensive, complete, accurate or up to date;
- sometimes linked to external sites over which the Publications Office services have no control and for which the Publications Office assumes no responsibility;
- not professional or legal advice (if you need specific advice, you should always consult a suitably qualified professional).

Please note that it cannot be guaranteed that a document available on-line exactly reproduces an officially adopted text. Only European Union legislation published in paper editions of the Official Journal of the European Union is deemed authentic.

It is our goal to minimize disruption caused by technical errors. However some data or information on our site may have been created or structured in files or formats that are not error-free and we cannot guarantee that our service will not be interrupted or otherwise affected by such problems. The Publications Office accepts no responsibility with regard to such problems incurred as a result of using this site or any linked external sites.

This disclaimer is not intended to limit the liability of the Publications Office in contravention of any requirements laid down in applicable national law nor to exclude its liability for matters which may not be excluded under that law.

- *pour les mesures mettant en oeuvre le droit communautaire (mesures nationales d'exécution – national implementation measures), les références au droit national sont précédées de l'avis suivant :*
- *La mention de mesures nationales d'exécution ne préjuge ni le caractère complet, ni la conformité desdites mesures (*The fact that there is a reference to national execution measures does not necessarily mean that these measures are either comprehensive or in conformity*).*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
The Federal Law Gazettes is authentic since 2004. The consolidated versions (incorporation of amendments) are not authentic. Therefore the Federal Chancellery is not responsible concerning this information

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
Normally, SADER does not give any written guaranty to any of its users. All its products contain many notices related to liability, copyrights and other legal issues. Through its history, SADER has proved its credibility in Lebanon and the Middle

Eastern region. Some of the contracts signed by SADER contain clauses related to guarantees and liabilities.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
See AustLII answers concerning guarantees and disclaimers, which are the same for these services.

(8) Is the legal information that you provide up-dated in real time?

L'information juridique que vous fournissez est-elle actualisée en temps réel ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
There are two elements to the frequency of updating of databases on AustLII.

It first depends on the frequency with which new data is supplied by the official data provider. This varies from within half an hour of a decision being handed down by a Court (High Court of Australia), to daily supply (Federal Court, most Supreme Courts and some Tribunals) to periodic weekly, monthly etc supply by some more minor Tribunals.

Upon receipt of data, databases are updated on AustLII at different regular intervals, particularly in terms of how quickly the new content can be searched. Some are updated every twenty minutes (eg High Court of Australia, but all case law databases are updated at least daily. The updating of AustLII's databases generally reflects the schedule of the supply of data. Legislation databases are updated from between two days to two weeks of receipt of data from the official source, depending on the complexity of the data supplied and the amount of pre-processing which is needed before publication on AustLII.

AustLII provides on its front page an 'Update Table' showing the status of all updates for legislation < http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/legstatus.cgi > and for case law databases < http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/cases_status.cgi > , and this information is also provided on the home page of each database.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
Two days delay, see Question 7. / Le délais de publication est de deux jours, voir réponse à la question 7.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN is not content publishing system. GLIN receives updated material after publication by the official sources of member jurisdictions. GLIN members are urged to input laws to the system as soon as they are enacted; however, as the speed of response is wholly dependent upon contributions of members the timeliness of the information cannot be guaranteed.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Yes. In particular the DoGI database is updated monthly.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
No, if this means a live feed from a transcription service. BAILII is frequently updated within 24 hours of judgments being handed down. Commercial services are often updated very rapidly.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Non.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Yes they are.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
The Supreme Court of Canada web site publishes released information within five minutes. / La publication des décisions de la Cour suprême du Canada requiert 5 minutes entre le moment où la Cour rend le matériel disponible et celui où il apparaît sur le web.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
Yes and no. It is updated as quickly as official sources make it available. In the case of Supreme Court decisions, that is practically instantaneous and (for various technical and bureaucratic reasons) the decisions are usually available from us before they appear on the Court's own web site. In the case of US Code updates, official codifications are generally not available until for some time after changes are made, as they are updated annually on a rolling, Title-by-Title basis. The net effect is that some Titles can be as much as 18 months out of date depending on where we are in the cycle. We compensate for this to some degree by using other sources to create an updating service that the user can activate for any particular subdivision of the Code, which shows all enacted legislation bearing on that subdivision since the last official release.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
No.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
- *OUI pour EUR-Lex*
- *pour N-Lex : dépend des États membres*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
Only the authentic publications are up-dated in real time.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
All information is updated on time; weekly, monthly, periodically and annually depending on the content of the database.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
The answers for these three services are much more complex than for AustLII, because many of the databases are only updated periodically because (i) there is as yet less cooperation from data providers, and extraction of data from websites must be used; and (ii) limited personnel resources mean that databases can only be updated periodically. A database by database analysis is required.

(9) Is the legal information that you provide up-dated automatically by electronic means (if so, please explain) or by human intervention, or by a combination of these two methods?

L'information juridique que vous fournissez est-elle actualisée automatiquement de façon électronique (dans l'affirmative, expliquez) ou par l'intervention d'une personne, ou une combinaison des ces deux méthodes ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
Updating is mainly by automated means with minimal editorial intervention. Case law databases are fully automated; legislation databases requires some editorial pre-processing before software processes are used to convert and split a piece of legislation into individual sections; law journal databases involves some metadata extraction (eg document title, author, date) and some pre-processing before final conversion via programming scripts.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
Computer-managed processes play a major role in CanLII operations. Cases are program-managed from their acquisition and all along the way to their publication on the web.
Meta-data extraction is done by a combination of programs and editors depending on the source of documents. Conversions between formats are automated. Hypertext link additions are also automated, but only those related to judicial history are validated.
Quality checking is achieved by a mix of validating programs and senior and legally trained editor interventions.

L'informatique tient un très grand rôle dans les opérations de CanLII. Les textes législatifs ou de jurisprudence sont pris en charge par des programmes de leur arrivée à leur publication sur le web.
L'extraction des méta-informations se réalise par des programmes ou des éditeurs selon la provenance des documents. Les conversions sont automatisées. L'insertion des liens hypertextes est automatisée, bien que les liens ayant trait à l'historique judiciaire sont validés.
La vérification de la qualité se réalise par une combinaison de programmes et d'éditeurs séniors ayant une formation juridique.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN does not use an automated system of updating legal information (see the answer to question 8). It is solely the responsibility of the staff of member jurisdictions to up-date their material.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Combination of these two methods.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
BAILII is updated in a semi-automatic way by applying text processing software to the files received from the judges (which are usually written to a specified format / template). The subscription databases are updated by the suppliers.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Actuellement non.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
The legal information that is provided by us is updated by human intervention.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
Current Supreme Court of Canada (SCC) decisions are published by automated programs, made possible because they come from a unique source and contain high quality data. For historical collections reconstructed from paper, 1967-1987, the process integrates various quality checking steps. LexUM published SCC decisions within minutes. LexUM processes protect the integrity of documents directly coming out of the Court. For the historical decisions rebuilt from paper, the source is the SCR Report, one of the only two official reports in Canada. The processes preserve the integrity of the information. / Le service de diffusion des décisions de la Cour suprême du Canada est entièrement automatisé. Cela est possible avec une « source » et compte tenu de la qualité des documents produits par la cour. Dans le cas des collections numérisées depuis le papier, 1967-1987, le processus de production comporte diverses étapes de contrôle de qualité. Les processus mis en place protègent l'intégrité de documents provenant directement de la cour. En ce qui concerne la partie des collections rebâtie depuis le papier. La source est le recueil de la Cour, l'un des seuls ayant un statut officiel au Canada et les processus préservent l'intégrité de l'information.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
Most primary material is updated automatically. In some cases, there is a human "circuit breaker" at the end of the process to ensure that the updates have run successfully before it is published. In general, we transform data feeds from official bodies first into XML and then into static HTML for publication. In the case of the Supreme Court, the source data arrives as tagged SGML-ish data; for the US Code, we receive a proprietary government format originally intended for typesetting. Along the way, we typically extract metadata into relational database systems for use in some types of search, in presenting things like caselists by party and date, and so on. Where possible, we construct hyperlinks to identifiable sources.

Secondary material is created editorially and maintained by hand.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
No.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
- *EUR-Lex* :
  - *Mise en ligne du Journal officiel : automatisée, mais contrôles automatique et manuel en place.*
  - *Législation : automatisée*
  - *Jurisprudence : automatisée*
  - *Autres documents : procédures semi-automatiques*
  - *(travaux continus en vue de plus d'automatisation)*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
By human.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
SADER uses a combination of the 2 methods. SADER relies to a great extent on human intervention especially for information updates, translation and, above all, indexation.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
A combination of the two methods is used. Some data sources are sufficiently consistent in structure that automated extraction from their websites is effective, whereas others require downloading involving consistent human intervention.

(10) What is (are) the original language(s) of this legal information?

Quelle(s) est (sont) cette (ces) langue(s) originale(s) de cette information juridique ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
English.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
English and French / Le français et l'anglais

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN contains information in 13 original languages: Arabic, Chinese (traditional), English, French, German, Italian, Korean, Lithuanian, Portuguese, Romanian, Russian, Spanish, and Ukrainian.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Semantic tools such as classification schema are available both in English and in Italian.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
The Institute collects material in many languages. However, thanks to a network of collaborative agreements to share the work, the languages are mainly Western European. Other institutions have taken responsibility in London for legal information in other languages notably the School of Oriental and African Studies.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Le centre de documentation de l'ISDC est fort de 330.000 ouvrages dans une soixantaine de langues (textes législatifs, jurisprudence, traités, principaux commentaires, monographies et plus de 2.000 revues juridiques papier). Le catalogue (OPAC) est accessible en ligne (http://opac.isdc.ch/gateway). La bibliothèque permet également l'accès à plusieurs milliers de périodiques juridiques électroniques en langue originale, accessibles par internet ou depuis le serveur local. La recherche dans le catalogue en ligne peut être effectuée dans la langue d'origine de l'ouvrage ; pour les caractères non latins, nous utilisons les règles de translitération anglo-américaines (AACR2). Depuis l'automne 2007, les ouvrages avec des caractères non latins sont catalogués en langue d'origine, il est donc possible, pour ces ouvrages, d'effectuer des recherches, par exemple, en langue arabe ou en langue chinoise.

Les avis de droit rendus par l'ISDC peuvent être rédigés et/ou traduits dans de nombreuses langues (y compris non latines comme le chinois, le russe ou encore l'arabe). La plupart sont délivrés en allemand, français ou anglais.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Arabic for the laws and statutes and English for legal studies.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
English and French. However, some LexUM services, such as Juris International, provides the information in three languages French, English and Spanish. / Le français et l'anglais. Certains services sont toutefois offerts dans trois langues : le français, l'anglais et l'espagnol.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
English.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
The Institute collects titles in more than one hundred languages and employs regional specialists. Information is mostly given in German.

Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex) **(Pascale Berteloot)**

- *Pour EUR-Lex*
  - *Toutes les langues officielles de l'Union européenne. La couverture n'est cependant pas uniforme dans toutes les langues (fonction de la date d'adhésion aux Communautés européennes et de la traduction de l'acquis communautaire à la date de l'adhésion).*
  - *Les langues officielles sont actuellement (ordre protocolaire des langues) :bulgare, espagnol, tchèque ,danois, allemand, estonien, grec, anglais, français, irlandais, italien, letton, lituanien, hongrois, maltais, néerlandais, polonais, portugais roumain, slovaque, slovène, finnois, suédois*
- *Pour N-Lex : Dans la ou les langues des États membres, en fonction de l'offre des bases nationales.*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
German.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
Arabic, English and French depending on the database and its purposes.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
At present, the position is as follows:

(i) For about two thirds of the jurisdictions for which AustLII maintains databases (Commonwealth countries, plus the Philippines), English is the official language of the legal system;

(ii) For the other 12 jurisdictions, the original language of the legal sources is a different language (Japanese, Korean, Chinese, Vietnamese, Thai, Lao, Khmer, Bahasa Indonesia, Portuguese etc). AsianLII does not yet provide databases in these original languages, with the exceptions of some databases in Bahasa Indonesia, Vietnamese and Portuguese.

This position is changing, as AustLII proposes to add a number of large databases to AsianLII in these national languages as its search engine (Sino) is developed to have the capability to search these languages. This will occur first with Thai (expected in 2008), Vietnamese (early 2009) and Chinese (2009).

(11) Is the legal information that you provide available in languages other than its original language? If so, please indicate into which language(s) it is translated.

L'information juridique que vous fournissez est-elle disponible en d'autres langues que dans la langue originale ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez indiquer la ou les langues vers la- ou lesquelles elle est traduite.

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
English generally. Some treaty materials (eg Free Trade Agreements) are available in other languages as supplied by the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT).

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
Canadian case law can be unilingual, or partially or entirely bilingual. At the level of the provinces, judgments are usually available in French or English depending on the province. In some cases they could be translated. In federal institutions, the judgments and decisions are available in both French and English.
Legislation is bilingual at the federal level and in more than half the provinces.

La jurisprudence canadienne est unilingue, partiellement bilingue ou entièrement bilingue. Au niveau des provinces, sauf exception, les jugements sont disponibles en anglais ou en français selon la province. Dans les institutions fédérales, les jugements sont toujours disponibles dans les deux langues, le français et l'anglais.
La législation est bilingue au fédéral et dans plus de la moitié des provinces.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
No translations are offered through GLIN; however, a summary of each legal resource is provided in English. Multiple language summaries are also available for about one-third of the legal resources in the database.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
The contents of the databases are in Italian. However the classification schemes are available in English as well, so as to provide cross-language search and retrieval facilities.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
Where material is collected which originates in languages other than Western European, material in translation is also collected. Translations into English are acquired where they exist and if not available then translations into German (often for Materials from Eastern Europe). We rely on existing authorised and published translations and do not carry out translation ourselves.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Les collections de la bibliothèque sont en principe dans les langues d'origine. Nous procédons à des achats de traductions, si elles existent, pour les langues difficiles d'accès (arabe, chinois, japonais, etc.).

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Yes, if the original language is Arabic it is normally translated into English.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
Supreme Court of Canada decisions are available in both French and English. / Les décisions de la Cour suprême du Canada sont disponibles en anglais et en français.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
We have recently begun to translate some of our secondary material into Spanish.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
The Institute seeks to provide material in Western European languages but this is of course a limited option. In the case of legal opinions the key materials are translated into German or English.

Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex) **(Pascale Berteloot)**
Pour le droit de l'Union: Les traités et la législation sont authentiques dans toutes les langues. Les arrêts de la juridiction communautaire sont authentiques dans la langue de procédure. Ils sont traduits vers les autres langues (excepté l'irlandais qui a un statut dérogatoire).

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning) –
English versions of selected Austrian laws are available.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
Yes, if the original language is Arabic it is normally translated into English and French.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
Yes, for all jurisdictions in AsianLII, some databases are available translated into English. These are currently included in AsianLII in order to provide a cross-jurisdictional comparative law search facility.

(12) What are the functionalities of your search engine (*e.g.*, open search, limited to predefined key words, etc.)?

Quelles sont les fonctionnalités de votre moteur (par exemple : recherche ouverte, limitée à des termes clefs prédéfinis, etc.) ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
AustLII's SINO (Size Is No Object) search engine is a full-text search engine supporting keyword searches as well as Boolean, proximity and other search operators with relevance ranking. It maintains very fast retrieval speeds over very large database collections. It can handle word derivatives and synonyms. It was written and is maintained by AustLII Co-Director Andrew Mowbray and is open source software. SINO supports ASCII and ISO-8859-1 (Western European) encoded documents natively and with minor configuration and recompilation, it can handle other ISO encoded documents. It also has experimental support for UTF-8 encoded documents. See < http://www.austlii.edu.au/techlib/software/sino/ > for further details, and the 2007 Annual Report p14 for recent search engine enhancements.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
The search engine is ELIISA from LexUM. The help page is accessible at http://www.iijcan.org/en/info/search.html. Eliisa supports structured search as well as full-text search. All sorts of operators are provided to offer maximum search efficiency. / L'outil de recherche de CanLII est ELIISA de LexUM. La page d'aide de la recherche est disponible à l'adresse suivante : http://www.iijcan.org/fr/info/recherche.html. Eliisa supporte tant la recherche structurée, par champ, que la recherche en texte libre. De nombreux opérateurs sont disponibles afin de favoriser la plus grande efficacité en recherche.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
The summaries and associated descriptive information (metadata) for all legal resources in GLIN are fully searchable. The full texts of the laws, judicial decisions and other legal resources are not searchable through GLIN; however, search engines such as Google do enable full text searching. GLIN is also uses a controlled vocabulary, i.e., a centralized GLIN thesaurus that has been developed specifically to index the information in the database. GLIN also permits searches using Boolean operators and provides for the construction of query language searches. All search results can be modified by jurisdiction, date, instrument type to name a few of the limits.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Advanced search by using keywords, TOCs and a rich set of metadata, as well as browsing facilities.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
We use a very wide variety of search engines, often provided as part of a package with the legal information by publishers. The catalogue of library material uses both predefined key words (subject headings / thesaurus), predefined classification (knowledge map), and free text / open search. The Intute database also uses both predefined terms and free text. The BAILII search engine (Sino) uses a free text search with various algorithms for relevance ranking. The text processing to form the database automatically inserts hyperlinks to other documents (see the response form Graham Greenleaf who will be able to describe the search engine ion more detail.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Le moteur de recherche de notre OPAC permet une recherche par champs prédéfinis (nom d'auteur par exemple) ou n'importe quel terme figurant dans une notice (tous les champs sont indexés.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Our search engine includes an open search engine by word, dates and numbers.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
LexUM uses ELIISA, its own search engine based on that of Lucene libraries. / LexUM utilise ELIISA, l'outil développé sur la base de la librairie Lucene.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
We use a full-text engine whose capabilities are augmented differently depending on the collection – usually either by injecting metadata into the indexing process as fielded information or by taking advantage of structural features of the documents in the corpus -- and on what we detect in the user's input. For example, we might order results differently for a search that we believe to be a case name or official citation; there are too many possibilities and variations to list here. In general we favor approaches that favor context and understanding over precision.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
Open access.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**

- *EUR-Lex : recherche selon plusieurs critères utilisables isolément ou de façon cumulative ; possibilité d'affiner des résultats de recherche ; recherche possible sur les termes d'un thesaurus (Eurovoc) ; recherche ouverte uniquement sur titre ou sur titre et texte.*

- *N-Lex :recherche selon un ensemble de critères définis avec les États membres et fonction des critères de recherche offerts par chacune des bases nationales.*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
Open search with operators.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
SADER search engines include an open search engine by word, dates and numbers, an alphabetical index by subjects based on predefined key words, a chronological index by dates and a cross indexation system.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
See answers concerning AustLII.

(13) Is it possible to search in languages other than the original language of the available legal information?

Est-il possible de faire des recherches dans d'autres langues que la langue originale des informations juridiques qui sont disponibles ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
Only if the appropriate metadata or translation data is supplied to facilitate such searching. Generally, on AustLII, only the English version is available, being the original language of the legal information (see accompanying paper on WorldLII/AsianLII/CommonLII for additional comments).

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
CanLII is a bilingual site. However, not all documents are available in both languages./ Le site CanLII est bilingue, cela dit, tous les documents ne sont pas disponibles en anglais et en français.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
Yes, GLIN is searchable in 13 languages (see list provided in the answer to question 10). The GLIN subject term index (thesaurus) exists in 13 languages which enables a search, for example, in traditional Chinese to locate laws for Spanish-speaking countries.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Yes, but only using the DOGI classification scheme.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
No.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
La recherche dans le catalogue en ligne peut être effectuée dans la langue d'origine de l'ouvrage ; pour les caractères non latins nous utilisons les règles de translitération anglo-américaines (AACR2). Depuis l'automne 2007, les ouvrages avec des caractères non latins sont catalogués en langue d'origine, il est donc possible pour ces ouvrages d'effectuer des recherches par exemple en langue arabe ou en langue chinoise.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
No.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
The site is bilingual English and French. / Le site est bilingue anglais et français.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
No.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
Titles of books written in non-Latin letters are transliterated (are made machine readable) and translated into German and can be searched in both ways. Ditto titles of Turkish books which are translated into German.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
EUR-Lex : interconnexion de toutes les versions linguistiques ; lorsque lors d'une recherche dans une langue le système ne trouve pas le document dans la langue donnée, mais que le document existe dans d'autres versions linguistiques, il offre l'anglais par défaut. La recherche avec définition d'un profil linguistique de l'utilisateur est en cours de préparation.

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
English.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
It is possible in SADER software systems to search in different languages at once such as Arabic and English or Arabic and French.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
See above answers.

(14) Does your organisation provide services to persons (judges or others) seeking information about the application of foreign law in the context of litigation taking place abroad? If so, please describe these services.

Votre organisation donne-t-elle des services à des personnes (juges ou autres) qui veulent obtenir de l'information sur l'application du droit étranger dans le cadre de contentieux se tenant à l'étranger? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez décrire ces services.

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
While there is a feedback service for general enquiries and feedback, AustLII does not provide referral services nor conduct legal research for users.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
No / Non

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN does not currently offer these services; however, the U.S. Law Library of Congress which is a member of GLIN may provide such services in those cases where the U.S. is a party to the case.

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
Because of Cornell connections with the French judiciary, at the Cour de cassation, the Conseil d'Etat, and Conseil Constitutionnel, research attorneys from Cornell Law Library have done research for French judges related to topics such as the U.S. law of extradition and expert witnesses. See question 16 for services and qualifications of staff.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Users are of a huge variety: they are mainly legal professional and experts, academics, students and public administration officers. They are mainly interested in Italian legal doctrine. However, academic users in particular who make access to the DoGi database are interested also in the application of foreign law in the context of litigation taking place abroad.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
Yes, we have a subscription information service to lawyers which is staffed by professional law librarians who take enquiries by phone / fax / email and locate documents in the foreign and international collections and send them by electronic document delivery (or by fax / mail) within the hour.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
La principale activité de l'ISDC consiste en la rédaction d'études ou rapports comparatifs et d'avis de droit portant sur les droits nationaux et sur le droit européen et international, et ce, au bénéfice d'une palette très diverse de clients : Confédération ou Parlement suisse dans le cadre de la préparation de projets de lois ou de la ratification de textes internationaux, organisations internationales de toutes sortes : institutions politiques, gouvernementales et administratives (officiers de l'état civil, autorités centrales, etc.), tribunaux, cabinets d'avocats, notaires et avocats suisses ou étrangers, entreprises privées et particuliers. La compétence de l'Institut s'étend à toute question touchant au droit, public et privé, de pratiquement tous les Etats du monde, au droit européen et au droit international privé et public.

L'intervention de l'ISDC est notamment requise en matière contentieuse, le Tribunal fédéral ayant, dans ce contexte reconnu que «L'indépendance et l'impartialité de l'Institut suisse de droit comparé sont […] a priori garanties» (ATF 28.10.2004–1P.390/2004/col).

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
Through our law firm activities, such information is provided on a for-fee basis or pro bono depending on the information needed.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
No / Non

LII (Thomas Bruce)
No, but yes. We provide no direct services, but many of our secondary materials would be helpful to someone trying to understand an area of law in an unfamiliar jurisdiction. See, for example, http://topics.law.cornell.edu/wex/securities.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
Yes, mostly photocopies of legal texts (laws and court decisions) from obscure jurisdictions.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
Non.

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
No.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
SADER Law Research Center and its Client Care Department, and SADER & Associates, SADER Group, through its regional expansion and connections, provide such services, normally on a *pro bono* basis.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
While there is a feedback service for general enquiries and feedback, AustLII does not provide referral services nor conduct legal research for users.

(15) Do you gather statistics identifying the main users of your services (practitioners, judges, arbitrators, academics, etc.), their location (country, region or continent) and the context in which this information is sought (general interest, legal advice, litigation, policy, etc)? If so, could you please share this statistics?

Maintenez-vous des statistiques identifiant les principaux utilisateurs de vos services (praticiens, juges, arbitres, académiciens, etc.), leur origine (pays, région ou continent) et le contexte dans lequel cette information est recherchée (intérêt général, avis juridiques, contentieux, politiques et orientations, etc.) ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez communiquer ces statistiques.

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)

Access statistics are collected as part of the normal usage collection process by the web server. Because access to AustLII does not require any login or other identification, only minimal information about users can be extracted from the IP addresses collected in the usage log via converted web address. The 2007 Annual Report provides statistics on pgs 11-13 showing that in 2007 average daily usage was 622,624 page accesses (as recorded by AustLII, excluding any cached accesses), reaching a peak of over 1M accesses on some days.

The statistics on pgs 11-13 show, for example, that Commonwealth government agencies made almost 2M accesses to AustLII (plus caching) in 2007, and NSW and Victorian government agencies over 1M accesses.

Annexed to this document is a list of the 200 identified domains other than .au or .com of all accesses to AustLII in 2007. They show, for example, that the highest recorded 'foreign' accesses are 350460 from New Zealand, 254263 from the United Kingdom, 229727 from Japan, 228286 from Canada and 187534 from Norway, and the lowest recorded access are one from Togo and Antarctica. We do not have statistics for sub-domains within each country.

However, it should be noted that approximately 50% of all accesses to AustLII are from locations where the domain of the access cannot be resolved, usually due to improperly configured servers. The figures below might therefore be considerably larger from any particular domain depending on the distribution of the unresolved 50%. However, the actual accesses on average, are likely to be at least double those indicated below, and may be far higher for some jurisdictions where server configurations are likely to be less reliable.

Extract from AustLII logs 2007 showing accesses from non-Australian locations

350460	.nz (New Zealand)
254263	.uk (United Kingdom)
229727	.jp (Japan)
228286	.ca (Canada)
187534	.no (Norway)
181628	.org (Non Profit Making Organisations)
152535	.arpa (Arpanet)
138027	.edu (USA Higher Education)
130600	.de (Germany)
126569	.tt (Trinidad and Tobago)
121360	.sg (Singapore)
92248	.my (Malaysia)
88202	.ph (Philippines)
71798	.nl (Netherlands)
66824	.in (India)
53196	.fj (Fiji)
51268	.cn (China)

43120	.ru (Russia)
41747	.za (South Africa)
36611	.cc (Cocos (Keeling) Islands)
36203	.ie (Ireland)
30612	.ae (United Arab Emirates)
28400	.hk (Hong Kong)
28293	.ar (Argentina)
24954	[domain not given]
21904	.pl (Poland)
21729	.br (Brazil)
21282	.it (Italy)
18852	.dk (Denmark)
18557	.pg (Papua New Guinea)
18206	.pk (Pakistan)
17303	.info (Informational)
16850	.fr (France)
16620	.id (Indonesia)
15442	.th (Thailand)
14838	.biz (Businesses)
14599	.sb (Solomon Islands)
14268	.gov (USA Government)
13632	.nf (Norfolk Island)
13499	.se (Sweden)
13335	.mx (Mexico)
12461	.gh (Ghana)
12264	.us (United States)
11741	.il (Israel)
11156	.ro (Romania)
10454	.tr (Turkey)
9730	.mil (USA Military)
9689	.ch (Switzerland)
9601	.at (Austria)
9187	.es (Spain)
8406	.be (Belgium)
7697	.eg (Egypt)
7345	.int (International Treaty Organisations)
7188	.gr (Greece)
5747	.tw (Taiwan)
5490	.cz (Czech Republic)
4895	.vn (Vietnam)
4316	.hu (Hungary)
4309	.kr (South Korea)
4080	.sa (Saudi Arabia)
4042	.ve (Venezuela)
3931	.fi (Finland)
3810	.yu (Former Yugoslavia)
3391	.pt (Portugal)
3205	.sk (Slovakia)
3060	.ke (Kenya)
2819	.hr (Croatia)
2771	.vu (Vanuatu)
2699	.ky (Cayman Islands)
2594	.tz (Tanzania)
2583	.np (Nepal)
2446	.ua (Ukraine)
2206	.lt (Lithuania)
2103	.cx (Christmas Island)
2100	.gy (Guyana)
2050	.zm (Zambia)
1905	.kh (Cambodia)

1880	.bg (Bulgaria)
1866	.cl (Chile)
1811	.cy (Cyprus)
1792	.co (Colombia)
1758	.ir (Iran)
1696	.lv (Latvia)
1611	.ci (Ivory Coast)
1607	.ug (Uganda)
1535	.mv (Maldives)
1517	.bm (Bermuda)
1469	.ee (Estonia)
1460	.lb (Lebanon)
1420	.zw (Zimbabwe)
1375	.nc (New Caledonia)
1314	.mu (Mauritius)
1213	.to (Tonga)
1046	.bs (Bahamas)
1041	.jm (Jamaica)
1031	.lk (Sri Lanka)
953	.is (Iceland)
855	.ws (Samoa)
830	.ma (Morocco)
794	.ba (Bosnia-Herzegovina)
781	.na (Namibia)
769	.si (Slovenia)
731	.bw (Botswana)
705	.pe (Peru)
698	.mm (Myanmar)
609	.gg (Guernsey)
600	.sy (Syria)
600	.nu (Niue)
591	.uy (Uruguay)
514	.by (Belarus)
425	.lu (Luxembourg)
398	.ck (Cook Islands)
386	.do (Dominican Republic)
370	.mz (Mozambique)
334	.qa (Qatar)
321	.bt (Bhutan)
314	.om (Oman)
313	.aero (Air Transport Industry)
304	.md (Moldova)
302	.jo (Jordan)
296	.ge (Georgia)
291	.mt (Malta)
288	.tp (East Timor)
278	.sc (Seychelles)
270	.mw (Malawi)
263	.er (Eritrea)
261	.bn (Brunei Darussalam)
248	.ag (Antigua and Barbuda)
246	.tv (Tuvalu)
243	.mc (Monaco)
231	.al (Albania)
226	.vg (Virgin Islands (British))
224	.je (Jersey)
204	.pf (French Polynesia)
203	.kz (Kazakhstan)
203	.uz (Uzbekistan)
183	.cr (Costa Rica)

182	.bb (Barbados)
174	.kg (Kyrgyzstan)
164	.dm (Dominica)
164	.nr (Nauru)
155	.gt (Guatemala)
153	.gi (Gibraltar)
149	.ls (Lesotho)
146	.sz (Swaziland)
132	.tl (East Timor)
129	.ng (Nigeria)
129	.ni (Nicaragua)
124	.vi (Virgin Islands (USA))
122	.py (Paraguay)
115	.coop (Co-operatives)
108	.su (Former USSR)
107	.ec (Ecuador)
101	.dj (Djibouti)
100	.la (Laos)
97	.am (Armenia)
93	.fm (Micronesia)
92	.mk (Macedonia (Former Yugoslav Republic))
77	.bj (Benin)
69	.bd (Bangladesh)
64	.et (Ethiopia)
64	.mo (Macao)
58	.tc (Turks and Caicos Islands)
55	.az (Azerbaijan)
54	.ad (Andorra)
51	.as (American Samoa)
50	.cu (Cuba)
48	.im (Isle of Man)
46	.bz (Belize)
46	.rw (Rwanda)
46	.ai (Anguilla)
45	.bo (Bolivia)
44	.an (Netherlands Antilles)
39	.st (Saint Tome and Principe)
35	.aw (Aruba)
30	.ms (Montserrat)
29	.fo (Faroe Islands)
27	.hn (Honduras)
26	.mn (Mongolia)
24	.dz (Algeria)
24	.mg (Madagascar)
22	.bh (Bahrain)
21	.pa (Panama)
18	.cd (Democratic Republic of the Congo)
16	.li (Liechtenstein)
12	.gl (Greenland)
10	.sl (Sierra Leone)
10	.af (Afghanistan)
9	.pr (Puerto Rico)
8	.sh (Saint Helena)
6	.sv (El Salvador)
5	.ac (Ascension Island)
4	.name (Individuals)
4	.ao (Angola)
3	.sd (Sudan)
3	.sm (San Marino)
2	.sn (Senegal)

2	.kw (Kuwait)
2	.sr (Suriname)
2	.mr (Mauritania)
2	.gm (Gambia)
1	.tg (Togo)
1	.aq (Antarctica)

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
CanLII systematically collects statistics about usage. In a nutshell, over 60 million documents are downloaded in a year. Users are mainly Canadian. However, usage from abroad is estimated to be around 10 million documents. / CanLII compile systématiquement des statistiques relativement à l'utilisation du site. En deux mots, 60 millions de documents sont téléchargés chaque année essentiellement par des usagers canadiens. L'utilisation de CanLII depuis l'étranger est estimée 10 millions de documents par an.

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)
These services involve not only finding accurate and up-to-date legal information sources, but also providing sophisticated research using a variety of electronic and print sources. The research attorneys are lawyers with a law degree, and a library science degree. Several are admitted to the bar, and some have clerked for judges and practiced law. They teach credit courses in the law school on different aspects of legal research, and hold the faculty title of lecturers in law. The courses include basic legal research in the first year, international legal research, business law research, administrative law research, online legal research, etc.

Because of our connections to Cornell Legal Information Institute, we also often receive and respond to requests for assistance from LII users.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
GLIN does not gather statistics at a level granular enough to determine exactly who is using the information or for what purpose. We do gather broad statistics on which countries or domains are seeking information from the GLIN database.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
No.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
Yes, large sets of statistics – including statistics about library users, their home institutions, their sector (academic, practitioner), their country, frequency of visit, use of individual databases, and much else. We do not record the nature of the legal research undertaken. The statistics appear in the appendices to our annual report which is on our website at http://ials.sas.ac.uk/about/annual_reports.htm.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
L'Institut suisse de droit comparé ne tient pas à ce jour de statistiques systématiques sur ces points. De nombreuses informations figurent toutefois dans nos rapports annuels accessibles en ligne (www.isdc.ch/fr/institut.asp/4-0-1003-5-4-0/) où un décompte précis des types d'avis est publié.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
No.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
Ten million downloads per year, two million from abroad. / Plus de dix millions de documents sont téléchargé annuellement, dont 2 depuis l'étranger.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
We gather standard web metrics and analytics, which unfortunately tell us little about profession or intention, but do tell us a lot about location and numbers. We receive an average of about 80,000 visitor sessions per day from over 200 countries, with the lion's share of usage coming from the US, and with non-US use fairly closely tracking the volume of trade with the US (although countries with which we have a common legal heritage tend to place a little higher). Timing of use fairly closely tracks business hours in the locations where it originates. Our overall usage is between 20 and 25 million page views per month.

We learn more from e-mail feedback from users and donors, and from subscription information for our e-mail notification services and RSS feeds. We have (on limited occasions, none of them recent) run surveys on particular collections aimed at getting this information. They have mostly confirmed our intuitions. We can also infer a certain amount from usage patterns (we have noticed that trade disputes between the US and its trading partners are often accompanied by research into the US Code, for instance). Anecdotally, we can tell you that our usage is divided equally between lawyers and law people, private citizens experiencing some episodic encounter with the legal system, and (perhaps most importantly) non-lawyer professionals who make use of legal information on a daily basis as part of their professional lives. This latter group would include some government officials, police officers, hospital administrators, and anyone in regulated industries or business. The population of lawyers and law people tends to be skewed toward small-office and solo law practice and toward government officials, groups that typically do not have the luxury of using expensive commercial services.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
All kinds of statistics – including statistics about the library use - are gathered in our annual report. They are not (yet) available on the Internet but can be shared upon request.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
De telles statistiques sont difficiles à établir et ne sont à l'heure actuelle pas établies ni pour EUR-Lex ni pour N-Lex. La question est en tout cas délicate parce que la collecte de certaines données peut s'avérer non conformes aux règles relatives à la protection des données personnelles (Directive 2002/58/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, of 12 July 2002 concerning the processing of personal data and the protection of privacy in the electronic communications sector (Directive on privacy and electronic communications) ; Directive 2002/58/CE du Parlement européen et du Conseil du 12 juillet 2002 concernant le traitement des données à caractère personnel et la protection de la vie privée dans le secteur des communications électroniques (directive vie privée et communications électroniques).Toute statistique établie sur la base des extensions des adresses des ordinateurs à partir desquels sont effectuées des recherches sont sujettes à caution (diffcile de résoudre les suffixes .com, .org etc.).

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
No.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
Yes, SADER gathers a lot of information related to the market. Without a non-disclosure agreement, SADER does not disclose such information.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
Access statistics are collected as part of the normal usage collection process by the web server. Because access to AustLII does not require any login or other identification, only minimal information about users can be extracted from the IP addresses collected in the usage log via converted web address.

Annexed to this document is a list of all the identified domains other than .au or .com of all accesses to WorldLII, CommonLII, AsianLII or NZLII (which AustLII

currently operates) in 2007. They show, for example, that the highest recorded accesses (other than Australian accesses) are 174327 from India, 153097 from New Zealand, 131016 from the USA Higher Education, 122897 from Canada, 79703 from the United Kingdom) and 55438 from Japan.

Extract from AustLII logs 2007 showing accesses from non-Australian locations

174327	.in (India)
153097	.nz (New Zealand)
131012	.edu (USA Higher Education)
122897	.ca (Canada)
79703	.uk (United Kingdom)
55438	.jp (Japan)
49667	.nl (Netherlands)
48789	.de (Germany)
42002	.org (Non Profit Making Organisations)
31869	.my (Malaysia)
31002	[unknown domain]
29700	.it (Italy)
28218	.sg (Singapore)
26953	.id (Indonesia)
24704	.fj (Fiji)
22918	.cn (China)
21758	.za (South Africa)
16572	[domain not given]
15439	.no (Norway)
14588	.hk (Hong Kong)
14127	.vn (Vietnam)
14014	.tt (Trinidad and Tobago)
14009	.pk (Pakistan)
13921	.ph (Philippines)
13558	.ie (Ireland)
12438	.pg (Papua New Guinea)
11907	.gov (USA Government)
11424	.br (Brazil)
8189	.ug (Uganda)
7662	.fr (France)
7176	.pl (Poland)
6847	.th (Thailand)
6034	.es (Spain)
5871	.ae (United Arab Emirates)
5753	.be (Belgium)
5647	.se (Sweden)
5113	.ch (Switzerland)
4972	.cz (Czech Republic)
4736	.arpa (Arpanet)
4208	.int (International Treaty Organisations)
3404	.ro (Romania)
3134	.sb (Solomon Islands)
3124	.ru (Russia)
2954	.kh (Cambodia)
2720	.mu (Mauritius)
2620	.at (Austria)
2094	.il (Israel)
2078	.np (Nepal)
2020	.hu (Hungary)
1969	.tw (Taiwan)
1959	.us (United States)
1953	.fi (Finland)

1914	.pt (Portugal)
1736	.mil (USA Military)
1733	.yu (Former Yugoslavia)
1699	.sa (Saudi Arabia)
1654	.gy (Guyana)
1609	.ke (Kenya)
1512	.kr (South Korea)
1482	.ci (Ivory Coast)
1481	.na (Namibia)
1435	.dk (Denmark)
1435	.ua (Ukraine)
1430	.gh (Ghana)
1344	.ar (Argentina)
1321	.lk (Sri Lanka)
1321	.tr (Turkey)
1234	.mx (Mexico)
1176	.gr (Greece)
1116	.lt (Lithuania)
1061	.cy (Cyprus)
1052	.mw (Malawi)
986	.zw (Zimbabwe)
956	.bs (Bahamas)
956	.tz (Tanzania)
947	.bm (Bermuda)
883	.ve (Venezuela)
838	.zm (Zambia)
813	.mv (Maldives)
795	.bw (Botswana)
759	.eg (Egypt)
727	.bb (Barbados)
724	.ky (Cayman Islands)
698	.cc (Cocos (Keeling) Islands)
693	.om (Oman)
593	.ee (Estonia)
590	.lb (Lebanon)
565	.ws (Samoa)
514	.cl (Chile)
510	.sk (Slovakia)
464	.bg (Bulgaria)
427	.co (Colombia)
426	.vu (Vanuatu)
376	.sc (Seychelles)
374	.bn (Brunei Darussalam)
370	.si (Slovenia)
366	.ag (Antigua and Barbuda)
347	.bt (Bhutan)
314	.ck (Cook Islands)
273	.nf (Norfolk Island)
268	.ba (Bosnia-Herzegovina)
263	.mz (Mozambique)
258	.ls (Lesotho)
247	.su (Former USSR)
235	.mm (Myanmar)
225	.cr (Costa Rica)
224	.tv (Tuvalu)
211	.lv (Latvia)
195	.uy (Uruguay)
184	.mt (Malta)
163	.hr (Croatia)
154	.dm (Dominica)

146	.la (Laos)
140	.ma (Morocco)
140	.pe (Peru)
139	.je (Jersey)
137	.tp (East Timor)
129	.biz (Businesses)
127	.is (Iceland)
121	.kz (Kazakhstan)
118	.jm (Jamaica)
118	.do (Dominican Republic)
114	.sy (Syria)
113	.al (Albania)
112	.to (Tonga)
111	.ge (Georgia)
106	.ni (Nicaragua)
95	.fm (Micronesia)
89	.nu (Niue)
87	.vg (Virgin Islands (British))
82	.lu (Luxembourg)
73	.py (Paraguay)
59	.kg (Kyrgyzstan)
57	.bd (Bangladesh)
55	.md (Moldova)
54	.mc (Monaco)
53	.nc (New Caledonia)
51	.aero (Air Transport Industry)
50	.gg (Guernsey)
48	.mn (Mongolia)
47	.tc (Turks and Caicos Islands)
46	.uz (Uzbekistan)
46	.gt (Guatemala)
39	.tl (East Timor)
39	.qa (Qatar)
37	.az (Azerbaijan)
31	.by (Belarus)
28	.ai (Anguilla)
27	.jo (Jordan)
27	.cu (Cuba)
26	.bj (Benin)
26	.aw (Aruba)
25	.dz (Algeria)
24	.ec (Ecuador)
24	.im (Isle of Man)
23	.cd (Democratic Republic of the Congo)
22	.vc (Saint Vincent and Grenadines)
19	.sz (Swaziland)
16	.am (Armenia)
14	.mk (Macedonia (Former Yugoslav Republic))
13	.mo (Macao)
12	.ad (Andorra)
9	.sh (Saint Helena)
9	.ao (Angola)
8	.er (Eritrea)
8	.gm (Gambia)
8	.pr (Puerto Rico)
8	.ir (Iran)
7	.bo (Bolivia)
7	.st (Saint Tome and Principe)
6	.pf (French Polynesia)
5	.ki (Kiribati)

5	.mg (Madagascar)
4	.kw (Kuwait)
4	.li (Liechtenstein)
4	.hn (Honduras)
4	.ac (Ascension Island)
4	.an (Netherlands Antilles)
3	.bz (Belize)
3	.cx (Christmas Island)
3	.sl (Sierra Leone)
3	.tg (Togo)
3	.vi (Virgin Islands (USA))
2	.sv (El Salvador)
2	.gd (Grenada)
2	.gi (Gibraltar)
1	.coop (Co-operatives)
1	.nr (Nauru)
1	.pa (Panama)

(16) What is the added value of the services offered by your organisation?

Quelle est la valeur ajoutée des services offerts par votre organisation ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)

- The only comprehensive location for conducting legal research in Australia. No government or commercial system provides the range of current legislation and case law for all jurisdictions that AustLII provides, or anything approaching its comprehensiveness.
- Consistency in the presentation and value-adding to all of these databases, as a by-product of this comprehensiveness.
- Hypertext linking to cases and legislation (including to specific sections of legislation);
- Sophisticated full-text search engine (SINO) and results interface (ability to sort results by Databases, Date, Relevance, Title);
- 'Noteups' - finding references (eg cases, legislation, law journal articles) to the document;
- Comparative research facility by providing different options in relation to selecting database scope eg all case law databases; individual databases or combination thereof;
- 'Point-in-time' legislation systems eg New South Wales, South Australia;
- Free-access case citator - LawCite (comprehensive, up-to-date, automatically maintained without editorial intervention);
- Subject-specific libraries eg Indigenous Law, Taxation Law, Privacy Law.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)

CanLII provides primary legal material from 150 different official sources on a site constantly updated and offers excellent search tools. / CanLII offre l'information juridique primaire provenant de près de 150 sources officielles au Canada sur un site constamment mis à jour et doté d'excellent outils de recherche.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)

GLIN provides English-language summaries of all legal resources in the database. In addition, members of the GLIN network have access to each other and therefore may have access to legal expertise that might not otherwise be available to them.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)

The DoGI database provides legislative references and case law cited in the periodical's articles and classification. Moreover it provides the abstracts of such articles.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)

Provision of information that cannot be found elsewhere in Europe (6000+ researchers use the library each year). One of the largest legal research libraries in the world. One of the largest group of trained law librarians anywhere with considerable accumulated expertise in foreign and international legal materials. Access to the expertise of the 6 law schools of the University of London. London is a major hub for legal business and for international academic visits.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**

- *Qualité et objectivité des informations fournies Authenticité de l'information.*
- *Indépendance et neutralité*
- *Richesse et modernité de la bibliothèque*

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)

Legal information in English is not easily provided in Jordan and thus our services partially fill the gap.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
In partnership with the Supreme Court of Canada, LexUM offers the main source for accessing the Court's decisions. Before CanLII, this was the only free source for these judgments. / LexUM en partenariat avec la Cour suprême du Canada offre la principale source pour accéder aux décisions de la Cour. Avant la création de CanLII, c'était d'ailleurs la seule source gratuite.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
For primary law collections, principally information architecture and usability. We offer more functional versions than official sources do.

For secondary materials, simply having the material available at all is a major step; the value is primarily educational, usually in a just-in-time context where the user badly needs to know something about the law.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
Provision of information that cannot be found elsewhere in Europe (1000 library visitors per year).

Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex) **(Pascale Berteloot)**
- *pour EUR-Lex, la valeur ajoutée réside*
  - *dans l'égalité de traitement de toutes les versions linguistiques ;*
  - *dans l'analyse juridique et documentaire de chaque document. Outre l'attribution de codes de classement dans un Répertoire de la législation et de descripteurs d'un thesaurus, un acte est analysé quant à sa date d'entrée en vigueur (qui peut ne pas être uniforme pour tous ses articles !), sa date d'effet etc. Des liens sont par ailleurs établis vers tous les autres actes auxquels il se rapporte (liens entre actes législatifs, liens entre actes législatifs et jurisprudence, liens entre actes préparatoires et législations adoptée) ;*
  - *dans le traitement en parallèle de toutes les versions linguistiques qui permet de passer facilement d'une version linguistique ä l'autre ou de faire apparaître deux versions linguistiques en face l'une de l'autre.*
- *pour N-Lex*
  - *écrans de recherche existant en 23 langues ;*
  - *aide en ligne dans les 23 langues ;*
  - *textes explicatifs sur les systèmes nationaux ;*
  - *écrans de recherche uniformisé pour accéder à des bases différentes ;*
  - *intégration du thesaurus Eurovoc comme dictionnaire*

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
- Publishing and archiving of legislative documents
- Authentic documents signed electronically on XML basis
- Easier administration of different versions of documents
- Implementation of a standard layout of the Federal Law Gazette
- Support for legislative bodies
- Service for citizens, business and administration

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
Creativity. Easy access. Rapidity. Accuracy. Ability to research in multiple ways. After-sales services. Training

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
- The availability of databases in English (both original texts and translations) provides a comparative law facility not otherwise available;
- The advantages of a high level of consistent presentation, and ability to search with one search engine, are even more marked than with national systems.

(17) Are quality standards imposed on your services? If so, please indicate the source of such standards.

Des normes de qualité sont-elles imposées à vos services ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez indiquer leur source.

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
No, standards have not been imposed. However, AustLII has adopted standards jointly developed with Courts, or which Courts have subsequently adopted, and it would now be difficult for AustLII to depart from those standards as they are so well-accepted (eg court-designated citations; exclusion of search engines from general case law).

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
CanLII, as it is funded by Canadian law societies, has to publish a product deemed trustworthy enough for professional use. / CanLII étant finance par les barreaux canadiens, il est tenu de mêtre en ligne une ressource d'une qualité suffisante pour se prêter à son utilisation dans un contexte professionnel.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
The standards are self-imposed and agreed upon by all members (see the answer to question 18).

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Yes. As regards NIR, quality is guaranteed by the compliance with the URN and XML standards. As regards DoGi, one of the main source of quality compliance is the feasibility study on SICI Serial Item and Contribution Identifier.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
Higher education system in the UK has various quality assessment and assurance systems which apply to our Institute although these operate mainly to regulate teaching and research and include library and information as infrastructure. Funding bodies eg for Intute have other quality and productivity frameworks and monitoring.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
Dans le cadre du Nouveau modèle comptable de la Confédération (NRM), les principes comptables internationaux (IPSAS) sont globalement repris. L'introduction d'un Système de controlling interne (SCI/IKS) est prévue pour la fin de cette année. Cette introduction se fait sous la surveillance du Service des finances et de controlling du Département fédéral de justice et police (DFJP) et du Contrôle fédéral des finances. L'ensemble des processus internes sont ainsi documentés et consultables.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
No.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
There are no standards imposed on LexUM, however for the last fifteen years the quality of its site has been deemed trustworthy enough to be relied upon by the Supreme Court of Canada / Aucune norme externe s'applique au travail du LexUM. Cependant, le site est d'une qualité suffisante pour que la Cour suprême du Canada y réfère ses usagers qui souhaitent consulter ses décisions.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
No. And in general legal publishing in the US resists such standards for a variety of reasons that interact in complex ways. At the level of government structure, design features like federalism and separation of powers tend to preclude standardization.

The dominance of commercial legal publishers in the electronic legal information market – and the near-duopoly they enjoyed until the mid-1990s – have also tended to preclude such efforts. Finally, the fact that many issuing bodies essentially barter official status with publishers in return for editorial services and other benefits has tended first to disconnect official status from quality standards other than those of the publisher and second of all to relieve official bodies from the "burden" of standardization.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
No.

Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex) **(Pascale Berteloot)**
Il n'y a pas actuellement de normes de qualité imposées pour la gestion des sites. Il existe cependant un certain nombre d'engagements de l'Office à l'égard des institutions de l'Union. Ainsi, par exemple, il existe avec la Cour de justice un SLA incluant notamment que l'Office s'engage à mettre en ligne les arrêts de la Cour dans l'heure de leur réception par l'Office.

En ce qui concerne les travaux documentaires (analyse documentaire et juridique de chacun des documents chargés dans EUR-Lex), il existe un manuel de méthodologie. Ce manuel fait en quelque sorte partie du cahier des charges des appels d'offres lancés pour de tels travaux.

EUR-Lex a fait l'objet d'une étude d'ergonomie qui donne actuellement lieu à de nombreuses adaptations dans le site.

L'Office a entamé par ailleurs une assez large bibliographie sur les standards applicables généralement aux travaux de l'Office (standards ISO, mais aussi standards européens ou standards établis au niveau des institutions).

L'Office entame également une vaste révision de son système documentaire interne en vue d'une plus grande cohérence et d'une meilleure gestion..

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
No.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
No.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
See answers concerning AustLII.

(18) If quality standards are not imposed on your services, did you adopt your own quality standards? If so, could you please indicate how these quality standards are established and verified.

Si des normes de qualité ne vous sont pas imposées, avez-vous adopté vos propres normes de qualité ? Dans l'affirmative, veuillez indiquer comment ces dernières sont établies et évaluées.

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
AustLII's standards and protocols are primarily self-developed in collaboration with Australian Courts and Tribunals and legislation offices, through interaction over 14 years. Protocols and processes are generally developed with data providers eg automated email feed system, templates used to prepare documents, adoption of neutral citations.

AustLII is now moving toward greater formalisation of these standards, in conjunction with peak bodies such as the Australian Institute of Judicial Administration, and the Council of Chief Justices, assisted by Australian Research Council grants to further standards development.

In addition, some are collaboratively developed with other members of the Free Access to Law Movement (eg exclusion of general search engines from case law, sharing of citation data). This type of standards development is also likely to increase.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
In 2003, LexUM, one of CanLII's two partners, conducted a complete internal audit of the product. Over twenty issues were identified and chosen as requirements for a quality service. For instance, a published document must be complete and the content could not have been altered. The search tool must return all documents corresponding to a query and nothing more. Many testing programs have been designed and implemented to monitor on a continuing basis the integrity of published documents. All publishing process are organized in two phases, the second of which is quality control.
En 2003, la direction du LexUM, l'un des deux partenaires de CanLII, a procédé à un audit interne complet des processus de publication de la jurisprudence. Une vingtaine d'éléments ont été identifiés comme requis afin d'assurer l'intégrité des documents proposés à nos usagers. À titre d'exemple, un fichier publié doit porter toute l'information, celle-ci ne doit pas avoir été tronquée ou autrement altérée. Autre exemple, notre outil de recherche doit fournir tous les documents satisfaisant une requête et rien de plus. Depuis, des programmes de test ont été conçus, des procédures ont été identifiées afin d'assurer l'intégrité de nos processus de publication.
Le processus de publication se réalise en deux étapes chez CanLII. La seconde étape a trait à la vérification de la qualité.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
The central quality standard for GLIN is that primary sources of law must come from official sources. Re-keyed versions, commercial versions, or links to government websites are not acceptable. GLIN partner jurisdictions commit to providing information from official sources, and as of November 2008, will digitally certify the authenticity of these documents.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
Internal monitoring in various ways including customer satisfaction surveys linked to service level agreements. BAILII as one part of its service has a government contract which specifies certain performance.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**

Les collaborateurs de l'ISDC sont soumis à une « Charte de qualité » de l'ISDC, laquelle comprend :

- *l'obligation des collaborateurs de répondre en toute indépendance et neutralité aux seules questions posées par le mandant ;*
- *l'application rigoureuse de la méthode scientifique à toute recherche, y compris la citation vérifiable de toutes les sources utilisées ;*
- *un strict respect du « principe des quatre yeux » à toute étape de la rédaction et de la traduction d'une étude ;*
- *la relecture intégrale des textes par un juriste senior (pilote de l'avis) et rédacteur du sommaire comparatif ainsi que par un membre qualifié de la direction de l'ISDC ;*
- *le droit du mandant de solliciter des précisions complémentaires si, par aventure, un passage du rapport était insuffisamment clair ;*
- *le respect du secret professionnel et du secret de fonction.*

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)

For example, concerning translation we have adopted three levels of translation; first translation, revision of the translation by a senior legal advisor, and editing.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)

Programs used for the publication have been systematically validated and no error was brought to our attention in the last years. / Les programmes utilisés pour la publication ont été systématiquement validés et aucune erreur de publication nous a été signalées au cours des dernières années.

LII (Thomas Bruce)

We have internal standards, but these tend to be loose and are more in the nature of "best practices" than anything else. We have certain minimal standards of functionality that we bring to all collections that are created by software; for editorial material, we have style guides and editorial oversight. Typically these have to do with accuracy, currency, hyperlinking, and presentation.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)

Quality is monitored in an informal way.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**

Voir réponse à la question 17.

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)

No.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)

SADER has an internal quality control system and management.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)

See answers concerning AustLII.

(19) Approximately, what are the annual operation costs of your organisation in relation to online access to legal information? Please make a distinction between human resources and information technology associated costs.

Quels sont les frais approximatifs de fonctionnement annuels de votre organisation relatifs à l'accès en ligne à l'information juridique ? Veuillez distinguer entre vos coûts relatifs aux ressources humaines et ceux relatifs aux ressources informatiques.

N / A

Note: Expert responses to this question have been omitted due to the confidentiality concerns of some institutions.

(20) What are your sources of funding?

Quelles sont vos sources de financement ?

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)
AustLII adopts a 'multi-stakeholder' model of funding, meaning that a multiplicity of sources of funding is preferred as a means of obtaining both long-term funding stability and independence of operations.
Up to 2007, AustLII's main funding source was academic research grants and a few key large contributors. In 2007, AustLII greatly diversified its contributor base for its Australian service. These included 23 universities and academic institutions, 11 Government agencies, 23 Courts and Tribunals, 21 organisations from business and industry, 142 organisations and individuals from the legal profession, three Law Students' Associations, two community and non-profit organisations, and many other small contributors. A complete list of all contributors is contained in the 2007 Annual Report at pgs 21-26.
For 2008 AustLII has obtained considerable funding from competitive grants, as well as continuing to obtain the wide range of contributor funding it obtained in 2007. All details of both 2007 and 2008 contributions (to date) are at <http://www.austlii.edu.au/austlii/sponsors/>.

CanLII (Daniel Poulin)
Contributions from Canadian Law Societies are by far the main source of funding of CanLII. LexUM is the other main source. Support takes the form of infrastructure and services. Canadian law foundations have financed major additions of historical material. / La principale source de financement de CanLII est de loin la contribution des ordres professionnels de juristes du Canada, les barreaux et, dans une moindre mesure, la Chambre des notaires. LexUM est la seconde source de financement, qui dans ce cas, prend essentiellement la forme d'infrastructures et de services. Les fondations de droit du pays ont financé d'importants ajouts de matériel historique.

GLIN (Janice Hyde)
Funding for GLIN to date has been provided by the United States Congress.

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)
Governmental funding as well as subscribers.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)
50% Government funding, 50% earned from various sources; BAILII 85% charitable donations, 15% earned income from government.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**
La Confédération suisse couvre le 100% des charges de l'ISDC.

Jordanianbusinesslaws.com (Omar Aljazy)
The sources of funding are self-investment and external funding by international NGOs and governmental entities.

LexUM (Daniel Poulin)
LexUM is self-financed from the various contracts it procures. LexUM also regularly obtains research funds for projects. / LexUM s'autofinance par les contrats qu'il réalise. LexUM obtient régulièrement des fonds de recherche pour permettre la réalisation des divers projets de recherche.

LII (Thomas Bruce)
We are funded by our parent organization (the Cornell Law School), by grants from the National Science Foundation (primarily for research activities), by consulting

and other commercial activities, and (significantly) by private donation from individuals.

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)
90% Government funding, 5% private sponsors, 5% own income through legal opinions.

***Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex)* (Pascale Berteloot)**
Budget de l'Union européenne (le budget de l'Office des publications est une annexe au budget de la Commission européenne ; ce budget comporte une ligne pour les bases de données juridiques.

RIS (LLI) (Bernhard Karning)
Taxes.

SADER (Omar Aljazy)
Self-investment, Governmental Funds, International Organizations and NGOs.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)
As stated above, primarily competitive grant funding, which over the past 5 years has come from the Australian Research Council, AusAID, and the Australian Attorney-General's Department.

(21) Other relevant information for the purpose of your presentation, including your initial thoughts on the potential added value of any work to be undertaken by the Hague Conference.

Autres informations pertinentes pour les fins de la présentation, y compris vos pensées initiales relatives à la valeur ajoutée potentielle de tout travail à être entrepris par la Conférence de La Haye.

AustLII (Graham Greenleaf)

- The work of the Hague Conference will be most valuable if it is standards-based rather than based on the 'status' of any information provider (and particularly not on the basis of any presumed quality based on status). In other words, no unjustifiably privileged position should be given to either government or commercial providers of information as such, but instead all providers of legal information should be able to aim to meet collaboratively-developed standards.
- The collaborative development of standards by the Hague Conference and all interested providers of legal information is desirable.
- Any resulting 'accreditation' will need to be at the level of an individual database, rather than a service provider.
- Any standards so developed should be realistic in the sense that they will not serve any useful purpose for the Hague Conference if they are set at levels that are so idealistic that no free access provider of legal information will ever be able to achieve them.
- The Hague Conference could assist the recognition and encouragement of the use of neutral citations (court-designated citations) for referencing purposes.
- Recognition of the status of third-party 'downstream' publishers of primary materials (eg cases and legislation) as 'approved' or 'authentic' - providing different levels of recognition depending on specified criteria.

Cornell Law Library (Claire Germain)

I hope that the Hague Conference can facilitate access to foreign law worldwide, and play a role in coordinating efforts. I also hope that the Hague Conference can become a stakeholder in helping to create a standard for the authentication of official digital law. In a world where governments are discontinuing print, and where the print document will no longer exist as a back up copy, it is essential to ensure that the official word of the law is as authentic and tamper-free in digital form as in printed books. The following provides some background information.

My interest and expertise with digital law issues is based on my own training as a lawyer from the civil law and common law traditions, and professional experience as the director of a large academic law library in the United States at Cornell Law School, in Ithaca, New York.[3] As a professor of law, I teach a course in French law, in Ithaca, and during our Paris Summer program at the University of Paris I Pantheon-Sorbonne. As a law librarian, I am actively involved in all aspects of legal information, from rare books to cyberspace, particularly the digital law issues, and the preservation and long term access to born digital legal information. I have been active in the American Association of Law Libraries (AALL), having served as President in 2005-06.[4] I serve as Secretary of the Law Libraries Section of IFLA (International Federation of Library Associations). I serve on the Board of Trustees of GLIN (Global Legal Information Network). As a comparative law specialist and as a law librarian, I have been concerned for several years with a number of digital law issues, specifically preservation and long term access to born digital legal information and authentication of official digital legal information (authority, accuracy, version control).[5]

[3] My Curriculum Vitae and publications can be found at http://www.lawschool.cornell.edu/faculty.

[4] AALL has over 5,000 members, who work as law librarians in law firms, law schools, courts, corporations, government offices, or as solo practitioners. For more information, *see* http://www.aall.org.

[5] "Legal Information Management in a Global and Digital World: Revolution and Tradition," http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=983197 35 *International Journal of Legal Information* 134 (2007).

As a Trustee of GLIN, I was part of a conference call a few weeks ago, where another trustee from Africa explained how essential it is for African countries to depend on GLIN to provide the official and authentic legislation or court decision, because the official system of distribution is not dependable, and print copies are often misplaced, or can be destroyed. GLIN' s main advantage over other free or fee-based services is that it is official, government to government. It gets the various governments to provide authoritative information in a digital format that can be used in the GLIN system. It helps emerging countries put their laws online and access free legal information. GLIN has a public policy role, as the provider of authoritative information in a freely accessible format for people who cannot afford commercial access. It could have a secondary role to provide the authoritative format to commercial entities. It could also be a key participant in developing a global standard for authentication of legal materials

The Problem with Long Term Access to Digital Legal Information[6]

In various countries of the world, official documents are going digital for good reasons, including easy distribution and access over the Internet, and cost savings for government which can discontinue the print costs. The process is irreversible politically and economically. However, digital information is characterized by fragility and rapid technological obsolescence. Under good conditions, books printed on acid-free paper, such as official state reports and codes, will last for centuries. The lifespan of a CD or disk is estimated at 10 to 30 years, but its lifespan is further limited by the hardware and software needed to read it. This means that digital information may become obsolete within five years unless it can be refreshed or migrated to a newer technology. Refreshing data (copying it periodically to more stable media) cannot solve the long-term problem. It can save simple ASCII files, but anything more complex may lose functionality that was built into it. Migration means moving files to a new system. It has risks, too, such as loss or change of information in the translation. Emulation is a digital preservation technique that consists of designing hardware and software to emulate an older system. Much research needs to be done on solving these technological issues.[7]

The contents of the Internet are becoming richer every day. One issue of particular importance that has emerged now is the need to have access to the permanent digital records far into the future. Current efforts have the same goal, to make sure that in a paperless world there will be a permanent record of the law in its many forms, and that the document will be authentic. They demonstrate the importance of working with partners, including the legal information publishing industry, the information technology industry, computer scientists, and other interested stakeholders, to solve these important problems.

Two web sites offer promise in this area. The web archive, Wayback machine, archives the web for future generations.[8] It is free, but offers a new service, Archive-It 2.0, a subscription-based archiving service geared towards a broad range of institutions. It enables subscribers to capture, catalog, and preserve online material from their own institutions as well as from the World Wide Web.

---

[6] I have been involved in that issue for many years, having served as Chair, AALL/Library of Congress Task Force on Preservation of Digital Law, in 1998-1999, on AALL's Special Committee on Authentication and Preservation of Digital Law, in 1999-2001, and organized a Summit meeting in Ithaca, N.Y., in the Summer of 1998, with Dr. Rubens Medina, Law Librarian of Congress. "The Future of Legal Documents," *Library of Congress Official Bulletin* (October 1998) http://www.loc.gov/loc/lcib/9810/law.html. For current information on efforts in the U.S., see *Membership Briefing, Preservation*, by The Special Committee on Permanent Public Access to Legal Information, chaired by Judy Meadows, Montana State Law Librarian, 10 *AALL Spectrum* (Dec. 2005 Center Insert). http://www.aallnet.org/products/pub_sp0512/pub_sp0512_MB-

[7] "Legal Information on the Internet: U.S. Perspectives," (Paris, Oct. 1998, French Association for the Development of Legal Informatics) (*ADIJ, Association pour le developpement de l'informatique juridique). Available at* http://*www.lawschool.cornell.edu/*

[8] http://www.webarchive.org

WebCite® is an archiving system for web references.[9] It can be used by authors, editors, and publishers of scholarly papers and books to ensure that cited web content will remain available to readers in the future. If cited web references in journal articles, books and so on are not archived, future readers may encounter a "404 File Not Found" error when clicking on a cited URL. A WebCite® reference is an archived web citation. Rather than linking to the live website (which can and probably will disappear in the future), authors of scholarly works will link to the archived WebCite® copy on webcitation.org. This particular archiving system may offer some hope to the many who lament the fact that courts and others (law reviews, etc.) too often cite to URLs which no longer exist.[10]

The Problem: Authenticity of Official Legal Digital Sources

In Brazil, the texts of legal rules available on the Internet have only an informative nature. They must have been previously published in the Official Gazettes.[11] In France, the *Journal Officiel* electronic version has been authenticated since 2004 legislation.[12] Why is this issue important? Because in every country of the world, in an environment where online sources have replaced official print legal information, citizens need to trust the "official word of the law" in the same way that they trust print information. Since the digital medium is vulnerable to errors in management and control, corruption, and tampering, it is of utmost importance to make the digital information both official and authentic. What is at stake is the transmission of official documents, "the word of the law," to future generations.[13]

In the United States, the American Association of Law Libraries (AALL) has been very active in surveying progress in the fifty states. During my Presidency of AALL, I commissioned a Fifty State Survey on official and authentic digital legal information. AALL's 2006 Authentication Survey investigated six sources of law: state statutes and session laws, state high and intermediate appellate court opinions, and state administrative codes and registers. For each legal document, the question was: is the digital version considered official? Is it considered authentic? The summary results show that a significant number of the state online legal resources are official, but none are authenticated by standard methods.

What is the difference between "official" and "authentic"? The definition of an online official legal resource is one that possesses the same status as a print official legal resource. The definition of an official version of court opinions, statutes, session laws, or regulatory materials is one "that has been governmentally mandated or approved by statute or rule. It might be produced by the government, but does not have to be."[14] This definition is firmly rooted in the print world. Courts and public officials turn to official legal resources for authoritative and reliable statements of the law and require citation to such sources in the documents that come before them. An online official legal resource offers no such automatic assurance.

The definition of an online authentic legal resource is one whose content has been verified by a government entity to be complete and unaltered when compared to the version approved or published by the content originator. Typically, an authentic

---

[9] http://www.webcitation.org

[10] George Nicholson, Associate Justice, California Supreme Court, talked about the problem at the 2005 AALL meeting in San Antonio, at a presentation called "The Great Disappearing Act; Preserving URLs Cited in Judicial Opinions." Audiotape available. Summary at *MALL Newsletter* 16-17 (August 2005). http://www.aallnet.org/chapter/mall/news321.pdf

[11] Edilenice Passos, "Doing Legal Research in Brazil, "Feb. 2005. http://www.nyulawglobal.org/globalex/Brazil.htm

[12] http://www.journal-officiel.gouv.fr/

[13] Claire M. Germain, "Digital Legal Information: Ensuring Access to the 'Official' Word of the Law," 26 *Cornell Law Forum* 11-14 (1999); "Digital Legal Information: Here Today, Gone Tomorrow?," *Syllabus (ABA)* 17 (Spring 1998).

[14] *See Authentication Survey Executive Summary.* http://www.aallnet.org/aallwash/authen_rprt/ExecutiveSummaryReport.pdf
The definition is drawn from the latest editions of *Black's Law Dictionary* and *Fundamentals of Legal Research* (by J. Myron Jacobstein, Roy M. Mersky, & Donald J. Dunn) and adopted as a guide to survey participants.

text will bear a certificate or mark that conveys information as to its certification, so that the text is authenticated. The standard methods of authentication include encryption, especially digital signatures and public key infrastructure, or similar technologies.[15]

The AALL's Authentication Report raises concerns that must be addressed by the states, both as high-level policy decisions and practical matters. [...] To help foster changes, AALL, under Sally Holterhoff's presidency, convened *Authentic Legal Information in the Digital Age: A National* Summit to discuss these issues with the major key stakeholders, on April 20-21, 2007. Approximately fifty delegates from the judiciary, the legal community, state governments, and interested organizations, all of whom share AALL's concern about ensuring the authenticity of digital legal information, participated in discussions about the Authentication Report and explored legal and technological solutions to ensure that state online legal resources are authenticated and trustworthy. AALL's philosophy is to help ensure access to the permanent digital records far into the future; to make sure that in a paperless world there will be a permanent record of the law in its many forms, and that the document will be authentic.

In the U.S., at the federal level, the U.S. Government Printing Office is moving rapidly toward a digital system to replace print government documents.[16] The G.P.O.'s Future Digital System (FDsys) is expected to automate the collection and dissemination of electronic information from all three branches of government: executive, legislative, and judicial. Information will be permanently available in electronic format, authenticated, with version control, and accessible via the web for searching, viewing, downloading, and printing. The first public release of FDsys is scheduled for December 2007.[17]

Update on USA

A special section of the AALL Web site highlights the report and the 2007 National Summit, [18] including related articles and news items. One of the attendees, the Honorable Herbert B. Dixon, Jr., published an article in the ABA's *The Judge's Journal* in summer of 2007 in which he highlights why the courts must begin to authenticate their documents.[19]

In July 2007, Michele Timmons, who is the Minnesota Revisor of Statutes and also a member of the Uniform Law Commission. (also known as the National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws), submitted a proposal to create a study

---

[15] A Public Key Infrastructure (PKI) is "an asymmetric cryptography security environment that supports the transmission, delivery, and receipt of digital communications over a non-secure communications channel. PKI uses a pair of cryptographically related keys known as public and private keys which verify the identity of the sender (signing) and/or ensure privacy (encryption)." Information provided by Mike Wash, Chief Technical Officer, U.S. Government Printing Office. For further reading, *see Public Key Infrastructure Assessment Guidelines*, American Bar Association, Electronic Commerce and Information Technology Division, Information Security Committee (2003).

[16] *See The Authentication White Paper* and the *Version Control White Paper*, prepared by the U.S. Government Printing Office in 2005. The Authentication White Paper addresses planning and implementation issues related to authentication of electronic content.
http://www.access.gpo.gov/su_docs/fdlp/pubs/proceedings/05spring/cdqa/authentication_white_paper.pdf.
The Version Control White Paper addresses planning and implementation issues related to version control of electronic content within the scope of the Federal Depository Library Program (FDLP).
http://www.access.gpo.gov/su_docs/fdlp/pubs/proceedings/05spring/cdqa/version_control_white_paper.pdf
For an earlier commentary, *see* "Le projet GPO visant à conserver l'ensemble des données juridiques publiques américaines," Cornell Law School Working Paper Series, Paper 17 (November 2004). http://lsr.nellco.org/cornell/clsops/papers/17/

[17] Information provided by Mike Wash, Chief Technical Officer, U.S. Government Printing Office, at the AALL Authentication Summit, Chicago, April 20-21, 2007. *See also* http://www.gpo.gov/projects/fdsys.htm

[18] http://www.aallnet.org/summit. The fifty invitees included representatives from the American Bar Association, the National Conference of State Legislators, the National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws, as well as high level officials from state courts, state legislatures, state libraries and archives, and the Federal government.

[19] Honorable Herbert B. Dixon, Jr. "The Lack of Effort to Ensure Integrity and Trustworthiness of Online Legal Information and Documents," *The Judge's Journal*, Vol. 46, No. 3 (Summer 2007). Available at http://www.aallnet.org/summit/TECHLackEffort.pdf (last visited 8 August 2008).

committee to explore the complex issues regarding digital authentication. The request was approved, and a new "Study Committee on Online Authentication of Legal Materials" started its work in October 2008. The Uniform Law Commission provides states with non-partisan legislation that brings clarity and stability to critical areas of the law. In 1999, the ULC promulgated the Uniform Electronic Transactions Act, a comprehensive effort to prepare state law for electronic commerce's advent. The charge of the new Study Committee is to investigate the issues and discuss the feasibility of a state uniform law or model act on digital authentication. AALL has been invited to appoint an observer to the study committee.

Toward Authentication of U.S. laws

The Government Printing Office (GPO) has unveiled an authenticated online collection of the *Public and Private Laws of the 110th Congress*[20] and the *President's FY 2009 Federal Budget*[21] which have been digitally signed and certified. GPO hopes to provide online access to authenticated House and Senate bills when the new 111th Congress convenes in January 2009.

Statement of Principles by Association of Reporters of Judicial Decisions (ARJD)[22]

In February 2007, the Association of Reporters of Judicial Decisions (ARJD), an international organization of individuals responsible for preparing the opinions and judgments of appellate and other courts for official publication, issued its Statement of Principles: "Official" On-Line Documents:[23]

1. A government document should not be considered "official" unless it is authorized by law or is designated "official" by the governmental entity that issued it.

2. There should be only one "official" version of a document in existence at any one time.

3. Print publication, because of its reliability, is the preferred medium for government documents at the present time.

4. If a government entity chooses to designate multiple co-existing versions (print and/or electronic) as "official," mechanisms must be provided to ensure that each of those official versions meets criteria for authentication and permanence.

5. An on-line government document, even one designated "official" cannot be considered authoritative if it does not satisfy the authentication and permanence criteria.

6. If the print version of an official document meets the foregoing authentication and permanence criteria, the print version (and any printed errata thereto) should control and be considered authoritative whenever there is a discrepancy between it and an on-line version of the same document that has also been designated "official."

---

[20] U.S. Government Printing Office. *Public and Private Laws of the 110th Congress*. Washington, D.C. Available on GPO Access at http://www.gpoaccess.gov/plaws/110publ.html (last visited August 8, 2008).

[21] U.S. Government Printing Office. *FY 2009 Budget of the United States Government*. Washington, D.C. Available on GPO Access at http://www.gpoaccess.gov/usbudget/index.html (last visited August 8, 2008).

[22] Association of Reporters of Judicial Decisions. *Statement of Principles: "Official" On-Line Documents*. College Park, MD, (February 2007, Revised May 2008). Available at: http://www.aallnet.org/summit/ARJDPrinciples_May2008.pdf (last visited October 14, 2008)

[23] Association of Reporters of Judicial Decisions. *Statement of Principles: "Official" On-Line Documents*. College Park, MD, (February 2007, Revised May 2008). Available at: http://www.aallnet.org/summit/ARJDPrinciples_May2008.pdf (last visited October 14, 2008)

Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques, Italian National Research Council (Enrico Francesconi)

One of the main purposes of ITTIG-CNR is the development of advanced tools to implement legislative standards, to provide semantic search facilities on legal documents, to develop AI solutions in the field of legal information systems.

Institute of Advanced Legal Studies, University of London (Jules Winterton)

I concentrate in my notes on the electronic publication of foreign legal information on the Internet. I do not discuss the use of centres of expertise (along the lines for example that the German government uses the Max Planck Institute in Hamburg with whom you have no doubt discussed that aspect of the proposal).

Background

The International Association of Law Libraries represents specialist law librarians and legal information professionals around the world from all sectors including parliaments, courts, law firms, governments, international organisations, universities, etc. Most are explicitly involved in facilitating access to foreign, comparative and international law (fcil) using all the means available: commercial, government, and free publications in print and electronic form and human networks. Many are involved in making fcil more easily, freely and reliably available through involvement in publishing, indexing, and commentary.

The Institute of Advanced Legal Studies of the University of London is a leading academic institution which operates on of the world's great law libraries and legal research information centres and acts as the acknowledged national legal research library for the UK. The Institute is regularly and frequently requested to provide foreign law information using its collections and information expertise. It is familiar with the obstacles in successfully establishing and communicating information on foreign law. The Institute hosts the British and Irish Legal Information Institute (BAILII) www.bailii.org, a member of the international group of legal information institutes which aggregates and makes freely available on the Internet primary legal information, see the right-hand panel of the home page of BAILII.

Strategic Aim

I welcome and applaud your overall intention to facilitate and improve access to foreign law. I understand that this is done within the context of your own interest in the operation of the legal system for which you are responsible. Insofar as this might imply the ongoing availability of reliable comprehensive and authentic primary legal information through electronic means without cost to the end user, this overall intention is shared by many groups involved in the legal and the information world and by others who consider it to be a basic requirement of a free and a functional society that such basic information is available without cost to citizens.

Issues and Key Factors

I believe you have identified some of the high-level key factors in defining the requirements, qualities and challenges of a solution. There is undoubtedly an increase in the use of foreign law and in the need for freely available reliable foreign law particularly but not only in the areas of trade and finance, communications, movement of people, social and family law and criminal law.

Principles and Core Values

Principles and Core Values concerning Public Information on Government Web Sites. I would commend to you this small leaflet which I attach as a pdf as I believe it is fundamental to your purpose. It was produced by the American Association of Law Libraries in the USA in consultation with judges, legislators, government officials and many others. It addresses concerns which have been the subject of detailed

research in the USA regarding the provision made by government in the publication of primary legal materials for the following:

- Accessibility
- Reliability – including authenticity
- Official Status
- Comprehensiveness
- Preservation

I attach a brief article which gives a little more detail. A recent presentation and list of further references are at http://hdl.handle.net/10065/583

As a minimum I would recommend that you adopt and promote these principles and core values to members to assist them when they move to publication of their legal materials on the Internet. This would be a major contribution both to the availability of foreign legal information. It would also be, in the long term, a major saving for those member states because it would assist them to avoid the pitfalls of hasty adoption of electronic publication.

Scale

The task is a very large task which has not yet ever been close to achievement. As I mentioned in my initial reaction, many countries have yet to achieve adequate publication of their own laws in their own language. The growth in the amount of primary legal materials and other regulatory materials is such that there is a quickly increasing amount of law in existence – a moving target for all those concerned with access. It would not be possible to achieve your goal through any centralised solution but must be tackled by a network solution. It clearly cannot be achieved using traditional print resources and must employ electronic means.

The total overall cost will be extremely high. Even the largest and wealthiest commercial publishers have not achieved anything like comprehensive coverage of more than a handful of jurisdictions. However, given a network approach, it may generally be argued that it is a legitimate government cost in each country. Even allowing for a responsible approach to reliability and preservation, it may represent a saving over existing traditional methods of publishing and distribution of laws and a genuine added value to the justice system and to individual citizens. If commercial publishers base their value-added publications on public information, they may be persuaded to contribute to the investment cost of such systems.

Comprehensiveness

The difficulty of comprehensiveness, even if a definition can be agreed, is perhaps exemplified by common law jurisdictions, particularly the United Kingdom. As you will know, the sources of law are very extensive given the nature of legal drafting and the case law which is rich but difficult to ascertain on particular points of law.

Stakeholders

Any solution should encompass the interests of the rather large group pf stakeholders, including commercial publishers. Even though your purpose may be limited, any large-scale coordinated publication of foreign law will generate enormous interest among a variety of groups. This will also mean that the definition of usability and delivery will be a concern for a wider group than the groups which are your primary concern. *This is a further argument for a network solution which makes use of existing initiatives which are able to consult more closely with the variety of likely user groups.*

Language

Translation is a major obstacle even if only attempted into one common language not just because of the cost and the quantity of information but also because the official status of a translation.

If only subject identifiers are translated to enable retrieval of relevant information in different languages, significant problems can be encountered since legal concepts

can differ significantly from jurisdiction to jurisdiction. I am aware of research into this matter at the Institute of Legal Information Theory and Techniques in Florence http://www.ittig.cnr.it/IndexEng.htm and particularly by Ginevra Peruginelli.

Recent Progress

There has been over the past decade or more a considerable movement to encourage governments to take responsibility for the publication of the law of their country 'free-to-internet', to steer away from exclusive arrangements with commercial publishers and to waive restrictive copyright arrangements (where they did exist) on such information which should be in the public domain. As you will know, governments have made considerable recent progress. Where progress has been slow other groups have taken the lead. As mentioned above the various legal information institutes have made a significant impact on very small budgets in many countries and regions in Europe, Africa, Asia, Australasia, etc., and a rather ambitious WorldLII www.worldlii.org. You may like to contact Professor Graham Greenleaf, founder in Australia of the first legal information institute

Graham Greenleaf (Co-Director of AustLII)
Professor of Law, University of New South Wales
Email: graham@austlii.edu.au Tel: (02) 9514 4921
Home Page: http://www2.austlii.edu.au/~graham/.

***Institut Suisse de droit comparé* (Eleanor Cashin-Ritaine)**

L'accès au droit étranger est une des compétences clefs de l'ISDC. Cet accès se décline d'une part en un accès aux documents juridiques pertinents et d'autre part en un accès au contenu de ces documents par l'intermédiaire de juristes qualifiés, à même d'expliquer au mandant la portée réelle et en contexte des documents obtenus. En effet, l'ISDC emploie 12 juristes étrangers représentant les grandes familles de droit et maîtrisant les langues nécessaires pour accéder aux textes juridiques. Ces juristes ont été formés dans les universités étrangères, sont tous qualifiés pour des travaux de recherche (docteurs en droit ou enseignants-chercheurs) et ont tous une compétence transversale (droit international privé, droit international public ou droit européen).

Des projets actuels sont en discussion quant à la numérisation du fonds documentaire, la création d'un intranet (plateforme accessible aux universités suisses), tout comme un centre d'e-learning qui mettrait l'ISDC à la disposition du monde entier. Par ailleurs, certaines discussions avec des éditeurs allemands devrait aboutir prochainement à la création d'une plateforme internet spécialement dédiée au droit international privé comparé

Max-Planck-Institute (Holger Knudsen)

Having studied the papers sent to me I got a clearer understanding of your intentions. As always in life, it is relatively easy to define a strategic aim – and it can turn out to be very painstaking to tread new paths. It is not a completely new idea to collect legal information from all over the world in one portal and in your accompanying letter you name the two most important: GLIN and WoldLII. While both databases can be considered an extremely useful means for research, they are far (very far!) from being complete.

I see some reasons for this situation:

- There are about 200 different jurisdictions (or: legal cultures) in the world with different legal traditions, different court systems, and different publishing and citation standards. After all: law is the only field of knowledge which is genuinely national and this makes it so difficult to collect in an a comprehensive way.
- The better information providers are and the better the quality of their products is, the less do they seem to be willing to share the information they produce in an open access system. There are quite a few countries where one leading legal publishing house profits from a quasi-monopoly (Austria, Italy, Greece, Norway, Peru, Mexico, South Africa to name but a few). After all: publishing law books is a money making industry.

- Questions of copyright play a role here. Publishers are only all too happy to use this as a weapon.
- There are other countries with virtually no publishing tradition for law books. This applies to about one half of the world's jurisdictions: many African countries, most successor states of the former Soviet Union, the mini states of the Caribbean and the Pacific area, and remote Asian states like Myanmar and North Korea. Government printers in these countries (for the provision of laws and court decisions) are inexistent or unreliable.
- Even in cases where legal literature is published and freely available, questions of language and letters (some Arab countries, China, Japan, Korea, Russia, Greece, Israel, Thailand, Armenia, Georgia and so on) make it extremely difficult to deal with this kind of material.
- But the most important obstacle seems to be the amount of money and – even more important – of manpower that would be needed to meet the aims that you envisage. I have no solution for this problem to offer, but I do look enormously forward to the meeting in the hope that fresh ideas will allow trying new tracks.

Publications officielles des CE (EuroLex / N-Lex) **(Pascale Berteloot)**

- *dans le domaine du droit, la recherche par mot peut être très trompeuse ; en effet, il se peut qu'un concept qui s'est développé dans la pratique juridique ne figure absolument pas dans les textes législatifs ou même dans la jurisprudence pertinente ; par ailleurs, le vocabulaire juridique évolue et la recherche sur un terme peut ne donner qu'une vue partielle des choses ;*
- *pour les recherches dans des bases nationales de plusieurs États de langues différentes, une solution pourrait être la création d'un thesaurus ou d'ontologies communes ; de tels instruments documentaires communs appliqués à des bases différentes devraient permettre une recherche d'information plus efficace et plus fiable ;*
- *dans une telle démarche, des systèmes avancés d'analyse textuelle peuvent certainement être d'une assistance importante, mais des contrôles et corrections humaines seront indispensables ;*
- *l'Union européenne accompagne systématiquement – depuis mai 2008 – ses initiatives législatives de résumés pour le citoyen ("citizens summary) ; un tel texte, même s'il est d'abord destiné au citoyen, permet aussi une information rapide du praticien ou de tout autre juriste en vue de déterminer le cas échéant le texte dont il souhaite avoir 'une connaissance plus approfondie et dont il demandera une traduction ;*
- *la traduction juridique est une activité complexe ; pour certaines combinaisons linguistiques, un système automatisé peut donner quelques résultats, mais il reste dans l'état actuel impossible de couvrir les nombreuses combinaisons linguistiques existant en Europe.*

SADER (Omar Aljazy)

Participants, organizations, public and private entities have to collaborate with each other on any potential new project and try not to duplicate the work.

WorldLII / CommLII / AsianLII (Graham Greenleaf)

See comments on answers concerning AustLII, which are also applicable here.

ANNEXE / ANNEX 1

Délégation à la paix, à la démocratie et aux droits de l'Homme

Réunion sur la coopération internationale
relative à l'information juridique en ligne
La Haye : 16-21 octobre 2008

PRESENTATION DU SITE PORTAIL « DROIT FRANCOPHONE » DE L'OIF

L'Organisation internationale la Francophonie, dans le cadre de la mise en œuvre de son programme de coopération juridique et judiciaire, volet "Diffusion du droit", a mis en ligne, en 2003, un site portail ''Droit Francophone'' dédié au droit de ses Etats membres, consultable à l'adresse : **http://droit.francophonie.org.** Il remplace le dispositif déployé depuis 1998 par la Direction de la coopération juridique et judiciaire, au sein du « Système d'informations juridiques, institutionnelles et politiques – SIJIP » de l'Organisation.

Ce portail est conçu pour offrir un lieu unique d'accès constamment mis à jour, qui rassemble des hyperliens avec l'ensemble des ressources juridiques pertinentes en ligne des États membres de la Francophonie.

La conception de ce site portail s'est s'appuyée sur quatre points à savoir :

- **un accès libre et gratuit au droit**;
- **une utilisation de technologies fondées sur les logiciels libres**;
- **un recours à des actions décentralisées**;
- **une décentralisation des savoir-faire**.

L'une des principales caractéristiques de ce portail est qu'il permet la diffusion libre ou gratuite du droit. L'objectif étant d'encourager et d'aider tous les intervenants, qu'ils proviennent de l'Etat, de regroupements associatifs ou du secteur privé à prendre toutes les mesures nécessaires afin de diffuser gratuitement les documents juridiques publics. Aussi, la diffusion libre du droit peut et doit prendre appui sur la disponibilité de logiciels libres.

L'orientation proposée ici vise à réunir les conditions nécessaires à l'accès le plus large aux informations juridiques émanant de l'Etat, en exploitant les possibilités que permettent les nouvelles technologies.

Le Portail est avant tout un **recueil régulièrement mis à jour du droit des États francophones**. Les ressources sélectionnées y sont répertoriées selon leur contenu et leur provenance. Par ailleurs, toutes les ressources référencées sur le site *Droit francophone* sont analysées et commentées en plus de se voir attribuer une mention appréciative de leur pertinence.

A travers cette action, l'OIF entend d'une part, contribuer au renforcement de l'Etat de droit par la connaissance et la diffusion des textes juridiques et judiciaires des Etats et Gouvernements membres de la Francophonie et d'autre part, favoriser le rayonnement international du droit de tradition civiliste.

Les résultats que cet outil d'information et de diffusion permettront d'atteindre sont multiples :

- **Il entend assurer la visibilité et la valorisation des actions de la Francophonie et de sa production juridique, en vue de conforter l'Etat de droit, facteur de Développement ;**
- **Il permettra à l'ensemble des usagers potentiels (public, privé, magistrats et auxiliaires de justice, chercheurs, universitaires etc....), un accès facile et exhaustif au droit des États, à partir d'un lieu unique, et selon des méthodes et techniques communes ;**
- **Il est appelé à devenir un outil fédérateur favorisant les échanges de textes et d'expériences, ainsi que l'harmonisation progressive des droits nationaux, atouts essentiels pour la coopération et l'intégration régionale, ainsi que la gestion, par les États eux-mêmes, de leur droit, dans le respect de règles communes de gestion et de diffusion.**
- **pour les usagers, notamment, non-membres de la Francophonie, le portail permettra, pour toutes recherches d'informations concernant un ou plusieurs États, Institutions et organismes francophones, d'y accéder directement, et automatiquement, en passant par le site juridique francophone.**

L'objectif consiste à apporter un appui aux États, à travers les opérateurs nationaux, pour constituer des banques de données juridiques informatisées devant contribuer à l'accès et à la diffusion du droit. Cet objectif de donner accès au droit leur permettra d'accéder aux inforoutes de l'information, d'y circuler, d'y trouver des contenus francophones et de devenir eux-mêmes producteurs d'information.

x x

x

La diffusion du droit des pays francophones porte sur des enjeux considérables. Elle est susceptible de contribuer au renforcement de l'Etat de droit et des institutions judiciaires dans les États et Gouvernements membres de la Francophonie. Elle favorise également le rayonnement international du droit de tradition civiliste (pays francophones).

L'accessibilité du droit est également un facteur de développement économique, car elle réduit l'insécurité juridique si dommageable au progrès du commerce et des investissements.

Les conditions nécessaires à la plus large circulation du droit n'ont jamais été aussi réunies. Internet et les nouvelles technologies de l'information permettent aujourd'hui de rendre à coût très raisonnable des milliers des documents accessibles gratuitement à tous ceux qui ont accès au réseau.

L'expérience a montré toutes les difficultés qu'il y a eu au début du projet, d'une part à obtenir, de façon pérenne, la volonté politique pour organiser la collecte,

la gestion et la diffusion du droit, et d'autre part, les réticences de certains États à y participer. Cependant, avec le temps et l'apparition des nouvelles technologies de l'information, les choses ont changé : les attentes, voire l'engouement pour la diffusion du droit sont grands.

Aussi, parce que le succès de la diffusion libre du droit sur Internet repose d'abord et avant tout sur une volonté politique forte et affirmée des États de se donner les moyens de mettre en place des dispositifs efficaces de production et de diffusion de leur droit, Il conviendra d'encourager et aider les acteurs, qu'ils proviennent des pouvoirs publics, de regroupements associatifs ou du secteur privé à prendre toutes les mesures nécessaires afin de diffuser gratuitement les documents juridiques.

ANNEXE / ANNEX 2

Questions to experts from organisations offering online access to legal information

19 to 21 October 2008 Meeting on Global Co-operation on the Provision of Online Legal Information from organisations offering online access to this type of information

Member State:
Argentina
Information origin:

Dra. María Elsa UZAL .Judge. Court of Appeals National Commercial Chamber —Buenos Aires Argentina-. Private International Law Professor. Universidad de Buenos Aires. School of Law.

Questionnaire:

(1) What is the name and URL address of your organisation?

Nowadays it is possible to access the Websites of the Argentine Judiciary Power, surfing through the information offered from the Official Argentine Governmental Website. URL: www.argentina.gov.ar. There, it appears as an *item: Justicia* that allows to enter in the specific sites of the National Judiciary Power and other sites of legal information.

The Argentine National Judiciary Power (PJN) has its own website- URL: *www.pjn.gov.ar.* depending on the Consejo de la Magistratura (Magistrates Council)

Inside this Website there are some *items* related to the jurisprudential *use and interpretation of Argentine law* and *links* related to the Argentine law information with free full access to Judges, Prosecutors, clerks, and public functionaries such as:

- The ***data base of the Corte Suprema de Justicia de la Nación*** (National Supreme Court) —URL- www.csjn.gov.ar offers information about Supreme Court judgments from 1863-2008 (thematic summaries: part in image, part in text); Supreme Court judgments in full text from 1995; separate list of recent Supreme Court judgments; Supreme Court Library consultation: with information about national and foreign law: codes, doctrine, treaties, and a special Comparative Law Secretariat with 300 periodic publications and so on.

  The most important links of this database are:

  ***SAIJ**.*

  Sistema Argentino de Informática Jurídica, a governmental service from Ministerio de Justicia y Derechos Humanos of the Argentine Republic, brings juridical information taken from official sources.

  URL: www.saij.jus.gov.ar -. This database with 700.000 documents has the complete national legislation up-dated from 1975 (29.417 doc.), has a record of about 61.400 provincial statutes and about 390.644 summaries of jurisprudence with a selection of judgments provided by the National Courts of Appeals and Supreme Court selected by document analysts. It has also, 1829 Mercosur rules (decisions of Consejo and resolutions of Grupo Mercado Común) some of them in Portuguese and 4.518 doctrinal opinions in different subject matters. The service is free for the legislators and other public functionaries (by intranet access) and is free also, online, for the public in general in relation to Constitutional texts, Codes and recent laws and some other special research. The full legal information to the public is available only to members, with a small fee.

CIJ ()

It is a recent site in progress (2008) that it would be a national online network about judicial information matters directed to judges and the press / media with fundamental documents and links available such as:

INFOLEG

Centro de Documentación e Información del Ministerio de Economía de la República Argentina. http://infoleg.mecon.gov.ar

Corte Interamericana de Derechos Humanos
http://www.corteidh.or.cr

Comisión Interamericana de Derechos Humanos
http://www.cidh.oa s.o rg

Corte Europea de Derechos Humanos

Corte Penal Internacional
http://www.icc-cpi.int

Corte Internacional de Justicia
http://www.ic¡-ci¡.org

Tribunal Penal Internacional para la Ex-Yugoslavia
http:// www.un.org/icty

Tribunal Penal Internacional para Rwanda
http://www.un.org/ictr

MERCOSUR
http://www.mercosur.int

Jurisprudencia Suprema Corte de EE.UU
http://www.findlaw.com/casecode/supreme.html

Asociación Latinoamericana de Integración (A.L.A.D.I.)
http://www.aladi.org/

Universidad de Buenos Aires
http://www.uba.ar

Universidad Católica Argentina
http://www.uca.edu.ar

Universidad del Salvador
http:h'www.salvador.edu.ar/

And other local Universities.

* The Consejo de la Magistratura (Magistrates Council) *www.pjn.gov.ar.* database shows a separate *item* with plenary judgments of the different National Courts of Appeals of direct access to the public. Other summaries of judgments of the National Courts of Appeals that are made by the jurisprudential offices of each Court, today are only for internal use, but there are sites online in progress dependent of each Court of Appeals,

(2) How old is your organisation?

It was born with the Argentina political organization in 1853. The Supreme Court was organized and had records of judgments since 1863.

(3) What is the mission of your organisation?

The administration of justice.

(4) What are the origins of your organisation (*e.g.*, private, at the request of the Bar, statutory source (government), etc)?

Our "organization" is one of the three branches of the Argentine government and it has a Constitutional origin.

(5) Are your services public, direct open access, or does one need to be a member?

The judges, prosecutors, legislators and public functionaries, and also the public in general have free access.

6) To which legal information does your database provide access (*e.g.*, statutes, regulations, case law, doctrine, etc)? Are these sources limited to certain areas of the law? If so, please specify these areas.

Our organization is the original source in the provision of case-law or jurisprudence through the Supreme Court database that offers the Supreme Court judgments in full and summary texts that embrace multiple legal areas and Magistrates Council database provides plenary judgments of the different Courts of Appeals and some highlighted judgments of those Courts.

The link with ***SAIJ*** brings access to statute regulations (national and provincial) and other rules.

Also, there are specific *items* related to the Supreme Court Library and the Comparative Law Secretary and other links that make it possible to get doctrine information.

(7) What guarantee, if any, do you give for the accuracy of the legal information you provide? If a guarantee is given, how do you ensure the accuracy, reliability, authenticity and up-datedness of this information? Do you make use of a disclaimer of non-responsibility concerning the information you provide?

First of all, there exists an "*interphase certificate of consultation*", that is a certificate that the original programme used has been developed by the SAIJ. There is no guarantee certificate for the accuracy of the legal information, neither in the ***SAIJ*** nor in the Supreme Court database, but this information is supported by the seriousness of its origin, the conditions and the quality of that information are provided in the website. On the other hand, it does not foresee a general disclaimer of non-responsibility, but the scope and conditions, in the ***SAIJ*** case, arises from the Regulations of Use.

(8) Is the legal information that you provide up-dated in real time?

The ***S.A.I.J***. database provides the legal information about national statutes or other rules up-dated *day per day* according to the publications of the Boletín Oficial (Official Bulletin). The information about the provincial statutes or rules can be shown, in general, with a brief delay.

(9) Is the legal information that you provide up-dated automatically by electronic means (if so, please explain) or by human intervention, or by a combination of these two methods?.

The ***S.A.I.J***. information is up-dated by a combination of electronic means and human intervention (mixed system).

(10) What is (are) the original language(s) of this legal information?

The original language is Spanish.

(11) Is the legal information that you provide available in languages other than its original language? If so, please indicate into which language(s) it is translated.

The legal information is provided only in Spanish, there aren't translations in official sites, except for some records related to Mercosur regulations, which are in Portuguese, when these rules have been adopted in Brazil. In this case, the original version is in Portuguese and the rules are given in both Spanish and Portuguese.

(12) What are the functionalities of your search engine (*e.g.*, open search, limited to predefined key words, etc)?

The ***SAIJ*** Computer Centre has technology Risc (two servers), with a capacity superior to 100 GB of information, jointly with a link to the Internet of 1 MB; the software for document recovery, "BasisPlus", constitutes a functional database. The SAIJ has its own tool development (inter-phases and *thesaurus*). In the legal search information it is possible to search: introducing the date, or/ and the name of statute or rule, or /and the number of the law, statute or rule, or /and the theme (there are themes listed) or/ and key words.

In case-law or jurisprudential databases it is possible to look by Court + date, by litigant's name – actor or defendant- (+date); by subject matter and by key-word. A deep update of the database equipment is in progress.

(13) Is it possible to search in languages other than the original language of the available legal information?.

Governmental databases are not available in other than the original language, except the above-mentioned information in Portuguese. Only through some special private websites is it possible to get the information in other languages.

(14) Does your organisation provide services to persons (judges or others) seeking information about the application of foreign law in the context of litigation taking place abroad? If so, please describe these services.

The ***SAIJ*** provides information online about specific themes through a service called "Dossier", that is a particular research service by request on specific information about law, jurisprudence and doctrine. At present it is a very economical service, at about US$ 25 each research request. The information can be downloaded from the database or it can be received by mail.

The Argentine government also provides information through the specific offices established to this effect, and receives information according to the procedures foreseen by the international conventions that are in force. Only through the ***Ibered*** is it foreseen that a connecting factor of the Judiciary

Power should make a contribution to bringing information about the application of law for maintaining updated a system of information about the different legal systems of the Iberoamerican Community of Nations.

(15) Do you gather statistics identifying the main users of your services (practitioners, judges, arbitrators, academics, etc.), their location (country, region or continent) and the context in which this information is sought (general interest, legal advice, litigation, policy, etc)? If so, could you please share this statistics?

The main users of our direct court services (jurisprudence), online, are all the judges, but this service, in particular Supreme Court Judgments, is also available for practitioners and the public in general.

The ***S.A.I.J***. via its online site has a capacity of 7.000 transactions per minute but they receive 3000/3500 accesses per day, 2.000.000 consultations a year and 1.500.000 documents are read a year. It is freely available directly for the judiciary power, legislators and other governmental offices (83% accesses) and it is also possible the direct free access for practitioners and the general public (27% accesses) restricted to some recent or specific legal information, but the full access is only available being a member and paying a reduced fee of $40 (about US$ 15).

The information is sought in the context of litigation, in the elaboration of judgments and for academic research purposes.

(16) What is the added value of the services offered by your organisation?

The general public and not only judges, prosecutors and clerks, have direct access to SAIJ online 24 hours, 365 days a year. Also SAIJ provides training courses for the operation of the online system.

There are other added services such as: a "*News Service*" (25%/30% of accesses); *Pronto SAIJ* (an search-aid), CID (direct individual consultation) and a *Newsletter*.

The information has a good degree of processing and treatment of language, ordered according a juridical thesaurus which has a nomenclature of 20,000 words integrated with the Supreme Court thesaurus, to assist with searching.

(17) Are quality standards imposed on your services? If so, please indicate the source of such standards.

The ***SAIJ*** certificates in some programs like "Carta de compromiso con la ciudadanía", "Carta de satisfacción".

(18) If quality standards are not imposed on your services, did you adopt your own quality standards? If so, could you please indicate how these quality standards are established and verified.

There exist internal groups for quality controls.

The ***SAIJ*** database complies with:
Quality standards *in information:* official, real-time and complete information (100%) update, with a 24 hours maximum delay.
Quality standards in the service and product: in the Online response: the time averages 5 seconds or less.
Capacity of response over all databases online: 30 seconds or less.

Quality standards in the public attention: direct access online 24 hours a day, 365 days a year.
Quality standards in public satisfaction: between 73,33% and 100%: average: 90% .
The source of these standards emanates from CID (it is an internal process).

(19) Approximately, what are the annual operation costs of your organisation in relation to *online* access to legal information? Please make a distinction between human resources and information technology associated costs.

The Direction of ***SAIJ*** is applying for a budget of $ 5.431.000 for 2009. Half of this amount is destined to update their database.

(20) What are your sources of funding?

The source of funding for the above-mentioned database is, always, the Argentine Annual National Budget of the Judiciary Power or Executive Power approved by Congress (Parliament)

(21) Other relevant information for the purpose of your presentation, including your initial thoughts on the potential added value of any work to be undertaken by the Hague Conference.

The Project to create a database system of global cooperation on the provision of online legal information about national law of each Member State country - comprehensive not only of statutes and regulations but also of jurisprudence, case laws and doctrine- is really, in my opinion, the only possibility of getting the goal proposed of achieving a global, ample and updated information really effective and useful in daily practice.

Surely, the cooperation between different official organizations, with the official web sites, belongings to each Member State Country and the organizational capacity of The Hague Conference -without putting aside the private organizations' contribution- would be the best situation to be successful in this ambitious initiative.

This proposal would require the creation of an instrumental background with the different needed commitments for cooperation of each Member State or each organization and the coordination of mechanisms, *via a convention* about *international cooperation for the access to online legal information.*

Argentina, in particular, via the ***S.A.I.J.*** data base (about legal information related to statutes and rules, jurisprudence and doctrine) and via ***the Supreme Court and the Magistrate Council databases*** (about jurisprudence and case-law) would be in a situation of make an important contribution for the materialization of these ideas.

October 2008

Dra. María Elsa UZAL